



International  
Trade  
Centre

## **Evaluation of the**

## **Women and Trade Programme – Phase I**

### **Final Report**

The Evaluation Unit

May 2016

## Preface

*The Women and Trade Programme is one of the ITC large programmes which represent ITC's dedicated and innovative efforts in promoting international trade for impact. The Women and Trade Programme aims to create platforms and channels for women-based enterprises to move up along the international value chains. Benefited from the financial support of the UK also with significant contributions from Norway, Finland, and other key donor and partner countries, the Programme had completed Phase I in 2009-2012 and is now implementing Phase II (2013-2016). To review the performance and results, this evaluation is commissioned by ITC Management and DFID, with a purpose of providing lessons and recommendations for future operations.*

*The evaluation found that the Women and Trade Programme was pioneering, relevant and a credit to ITC. For its time, it was highly innovative in developing business-generation events and tools to connect women-based enterprises with international market demands and to accelerate gender mainstreaming in ITC operations. However, specific country context analysis was not always in place. With the benefit of hindsight, the evaluation recommended that future programme design should allow detailed context analysis in each project country, to understand which project elements work well in which situations and how.*

*The evaluation was conducted by a team of consultants associated with Sanna Consulting (a list of team members seen in page 10), and supervised by Jicheng Zhang, Evaluation Officer, on behalf of the Evaluation Unit. The draft report was peer reviewed by Xuejun Jiang, Chief, Office for Asia and the Pacific, Division of Country Programmes and Luigi Cuna, Evaluation Specialist, Council of Europe Development Bank, and their comments are highly appreciated.*

*The Unit is grateful to the Division of Business and Institutional Support including the Women and Trade Programme team for the inputs and comments provided throughout the evaluation process. Thanks are also due to the stakeholders, partners, and project clients met by the evaluation team at ITC and in Peru and Uganda during missions.*

*Miguel Jimenez Pont  
Head, Evaluation Unit  
SPPG/OED*

## Contents

List of Acronyms .....	iv
EXECUTIVE SUMMARY .....	1
I. Introduction .....	7
Background on the programme .....	7
Objectives of the evaluation.....	8
Scope of the evaluation .....	8
Methodology of the evaluation .....	8
Evaluation process .....	9
Evaluation team.....	10
II. Evaluation findings and analysis: relevance .....	11
Relevance to ITC’s mandate, policies, and strategic objectives.....	11
Relevance to the country needs .....	11
The relevance of the design .....	12
Relevance to beneficiaries’ needs .....	13
III. Evaluation findings and analysis: effectiveness .....	14
Data challenge in tracking delivery results in countries.....	14
Objective 1: Influence programming and policy at the national and international levels ...	14
Objective 2: Build the capacity of trade support institutions to support business women .	14
Objective 3: Strengthen the competitiveness of women entrepreneurs.....	15
Objective 4: Mainstream gender into ITC’s policies, processes and activities .....	15
IV. Evaluation findings and analysis: efficiency .....	17
Programme and project management.....	17
Cost analysis.....	17
Monitoring and evaluation system and the quality of data.....	17
V. Evaluation findings and analysis: impact .....	19
Social impact and capacity building .....	19
Economic and financial impact .....	19
Environmental impact.....	20
VI. Evaluation findings and analysis: innovation, sustainability, replication and scaling up.	21
Innovation.....	21
The sustainability link between Phase I (2010-2012) and Phase II (2013-2016).....	21
Exit strategy.....	22
Benefits of the projects after completion .....	22
VII. Good practices and lessons learned .....	23
VIII. Conclusions .....	24
IX. Recommendations .....	26

Annex One: Terms of reference .....	30
Annex Three: List of projects funded by the Women and Trade Programme 2010-2012.....	33
Annex Four: List of interviewees .....	34
Annex Five: List of documents reviewed .....	38
Annex Six: Data tables Staff survey .....	42
Annex Seven: Case Study on Mainstreaming .....	47
Annex Eight: Platform and Capacity Building Case Study .....	52
Annex Nine: Peru Case Study.....	58
Appendix Ten: Uganda Case Study .....	62
Annex Eleven: Working paper: ITC's Gender ITC Mainstreaming Policy: Strengths and Weaknesses .....	68
Annex Twelve: Benchmarking case study.....	78

## **List of Acronyms**

BMGs: buyer mentor groups

DBIS: Division of Business and Institutional Support, ITC

DFID: Department for International Development, UK

DTIS: diagnostic trade integration study

EAC: the East African Community

EIF: the Enhanced Integrated Framework

ITC: International Trade Centre

IWCA: International Women's Coffee Alliance (association)

LDC: Least-developed countries

NTM: non-tariff measures

NES: national export strategy

PCR: Programme Completion Report

TSI: trade support institutions

TRTA: trade-related technical assistance

WITS: world integrated trade solutions

WBE: women business enterprises

## EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

1. This report presents the independent evaluation of the Women and Trade Programme Phase I (2010-2012), and some of the activities of the Phase II (2012-2015) were taken into consideration as references. The Programme Phase I had a total budget of USD 5.8 million, partly funded by DFID. The target groups of the Programme were women entrepreneurs, women owned small businesses, and women working in export-oriented value chains.<sup>1</sup>
2. The objectives of the Programme were to influence programming and policy at the national and international levels to address gender-based constraints to trade, to build the capacity of trade support institutions to support businesswomen, to strengthen the competitiveness of women entrepreneurs, and to mainstream gender into ITC's policies, processes and activities. The Programme designed and implemented six interventions including one mainstreaming strategy at ITC and five projects in countries. The projects are:
  - (i) Training and other internal capacity building to mainstream gender in trade projects and programmes in ITC;
  - (ii) Global Platform for Action on Sourcing from Women to link women entrepreneurs with corporate and institutional buyers;
  - (iii) Support to women entrepreneurs in coffee sector in Africa;
  - (iv) Support to women entrepreneurs in jewellery sector in Mexico;
  - (v) Support to women entrepreneurs in textile and clothing sector in Peru; and
  - (vi) Support to women entrepreneurs in alpaca in Peru to enter the US market.<sup>2</sup>
3. The evaluation found that the Women and Trade Programme was pioneering, relevant and a credit to ITC. For its time, the Programme was highly innovative in developing business generation events and tools to connect women-based enterprises (WBEs) with international market demands and to accelerate gender mainstreaming in ITC operations. The Phase I mandate was exploratory in nature, to gauge ITC's position in women's economic empowerment and to advocate in public and private sectors on supporting women in trade.
4. The evaluation concluded that the relevance of the Programme was high in terms of alignment with ITC's strategic objectives, contribution to ITC's comparative advantage in the trade and women's empowerment field, addressing the demands of clients, consistency between project objectives and project strategies, and some elements of consistency with the country context.
5. Regarding the quality of programme design, the logic behind the Programme was generally strong. The Mainstreaming project advocated that ITC would need to embody gender considerations in its operations; and the small projects implemented in countries took into the considerations of mainstreaming and business orientation and intended to provide WBEs with customized support and build personal confidence and empowerment. As anticipated by the design of the Platform project, the events were framed around specific market opportunities and business actions rather than advisory talking, the impact should be tangible.

---

<sup>1</sup> The overall programme costs are given as USD 6.9 million. DFID's share of this was GBP 3m or an estimated USD 4.7 million. DBIS commented that the total actual budget was USD 5.8 million. Another reference is the programme document, Women and Trade Programme 2010-2012; the total planned budget was USD 7.8 million.

<sup>2</sup> One project, support to women in informal cross border trade in Uganda, was included in the evaluation analysis. DBIS commented that this project was not in the Programme.

6. The Programme design should also allow a detailed social, economic and cultural understanding of which project elements have worked well and in which situations. This contextual approach would avoid risk of treating women in a stereotypical or deterministic way, and would provide a framework for embedding action on economic opportunities within the social, cultural and familial factors that act as barriers and enablers. Individual projects have provided strong lessons about these dynamics, and it would be valuable to conceptualize in an iterative fashion at the Programme level.
7. The effectiveness of the Programme was mixed among various interventions. The Programme met the target of influencing national and international programming and policy. For example, the Platform had a target of 22 trade development programme documents, which was exceeded with an actual figure of 33, according to the Programme Completion Report (PCR) submitted to DIFD. The clear output was that policy makers and policy agreements took into consideration women's economic empowerment. However, the Programme has no information on how or how often agreement is translated into action.<sup>3</sup>
8. The Programme partly met the objective for strengthening the competitiveness of WBEs. The PCR reported that 1,198 WBEs improved their skills against a target of 2000. However the evaluators were unable to verify the results and only obtained anecdotal evidence of impact on WBEs. The evaluation estimated that about a fifth to a half of project-supported WBEs increased in confidence, productivity and business diversification.
9. Through the mainstreaming intervention, the Programme made certain progress in integrating gender considerations into ITC's policies, processes and activities, and building the capacity of trade support institutions to support Women-Based Enterprises (WBEs). Mainstreaming would be more effective if ITC had strengthened resourcing for enforcement and related accountability requirements for all programmes and projects.<sup>4</sup>
10. The evaluation could not make a conclusive judgment on the efficiency due to the lack of data for conducting a cost-benefit analysis. The efficiency must have been benefited from the strong partnerships in countries. Based on a light benchmarking analysis, it was found that the average unit costs of outputs seem to be reasonable considering the operating contexts. The efficiency would have been strengthened if the selection of WBEs were with greater focus on spatial concentration and on those clients who were able to take advantage of the support provided by TSIs.<sup>5</sup>
11. The impact, especially the long-term impact, was difficult to judge because the monitoring systems at this time were weak. As a fact, the programme had a rich system of informal feedback designed at the project level to inform day to day operations, which is itself evidence of strong staff commitment on delivering results. Impact on the wider sectors would have been stronger if the role of projects had been clearer: whether they were pilots, demonstration projects, or partnership projects designed for continued operation. This concern is also related to the sustainability and exit strategy of projects.

---

<sup>3</sup> In the one case where fieldwork was able to track the implementation of a policy agreement - the Gender Dimension of the Uganda National Export Strategy, it was found that the agreement was not transferred into action by national stakeholders.

<sup>4</sup> The mainstreaming analysis paper of the Evaluation criticized the narrow conceptualization of gender as women and men, and it argued that narrow conceptualization of gender can have knock on effects by shaping policies in ways that can homogenize differences amongst groups, including on the basis of class, role or sector of work, caste, ethnicity/race, sexuality, ability and other spheres of difference.

<sup>5</sup> DBIS comments acknowledged that the link with TSIs needed to be stronger; this is being addressed in Phase II and more specifically in Phase III being designed.

12. The sustainability was mixed among various projects as well. Capacity building for TSIs ensured that some were able to continue the work when the ITC project ended, especially for the Platform project. The Platform meetings allowed ITC to use its considerable weight to create opportunities for women entrepreneurs – from awareness to trade. Sustainability would have been strengthened if the projects had had stronger exit strategies, so that partners knew what was expected upon project completion. As a kind of exit strategy, there are reasonably strong links between Phase I and Phase II of the Programme. Three of the Phase II projects are continuations or extensions of Phase I projects. Phase II also embodied substantial learning from Phase I.
13. The innovations promoted by the Programme in terms of integrating gender equality in trade development and advocating women’s economic empowerment are well recognized at ITC and by stakeholders in countries. For example, the Platform work of connecting WBEs to international buyers through events, forum, business-generation tools, and other channels are considered highly innovative, especially in project countries. This kind of micro-level business matchmaking service is not often offered by other organizations; it created visible value to WBEs in developing countries, and it is highly valued by project clients and other stakeholders.
14. The plan to replicate and scale up innovations was not explicit. In design, it was unclear whether the in-country projects were intended as demonstration projects so that the innovations could be replicated and scaled up. In some sense, they must have been, given the small budget size for each project and ITC’s pioneering role. However, project plans did not include necessary actions for replication and scaling up. The observation of ongoing Phase II activities showed that this weakness is being addressed by the programme.<sup>6</sup>
15. Based on analysis and conclusions, below are the recommendations provided by the evaluation for the consideration of the Programme in existing and future operations.

<b>RECOMMENDATIONS</b>	<b>Related evaluation findings</b>	<b>Implementation timeline</b>
<p>1. Overall, the evaluation endorses the significant value created by the Women and Trade Programme in empowering women in trade for achieving ITC’s development goals, and therefore recommends ITC management, DFID and other donors and clients to continue the programme to a new phase (Phase III) with particular objectives on contributing to SDGs 7 on gender equality and 8 on sustainable economic growth.</p>	<p><i>Para 4. The evaluation found that the Women and Trade Programme was pioneering, relevant and a credit to ITC. For its time, the Programme was highly innovative in development of practical tools for project management and mapping demands of women entrepreneurs, combined with gender mainstreaming in ITC operations.</i></p> <p><i>Para 8. The Programme met the target of influencing national and international programming and policy.</i></p> <p><i>Para 9. The Programme partly met the objective for strengthening the</i></p>	<p>During Phase II and in preparation for Phase III</p>

<sup>6</sup> DBIS comments: “Phase I was exploratory in nature and housed within of Office of the Executive Director (OED); it was not the role of OED to manage programme but rather to host the initiative during its incubation period then assign to the appropriate Division in house. Project design and planning was addressed and improved in Phase II.”



	<p><i>competitiveness of WBEs.</i></p> <p><i>Para 13. However, project plans did not include the necessary actions to serve for replication and scaling up.</i></p>	
<p><b>Recommendations in relation to programme objective 1: influence programming and policy at the national and international levels, to address gender based constraints to trade</b></p>		
<p>2. Taking into consideration of the ITC theory of change approach, the Programme management should commission an analysis, based on lessons learnt, about the way policy agreements can be reached and framed to increase the chance of implementation, so that the policy advocacy will generate expected results.</p>	<p><i>Para 8. However, the Programme has no information on how or how often agreement is translated into action. In the one case where fieldwork was able to track the implementation of a policy agreement - the Gender Dimension of the Uganda National Export Strategy, it was found that the agreement was not transferred into action by national stakeholders.</i></p>	<p>During Phase II and in preparation for Phase III</p>
<p>3. The Programme should emphasize the contextual analysis of gender development issues in each project and each country context. With more nuanced gender equality concepts, the projects will be able further adapt to the situations and address gender concerns through customized designs.</p>	<p><i>Para. 15. The Programme design should also allow a detailed social, economic and cultural understanding of which project elements have worked well and in which situations. This contextual approach would avoid risk of treating women in a stereotypical or deterministic way, and would provide a framework for embedding action on economic opportunities within the social, cultural and familial factors that act as barriers and enablers.</i></p>	<p>During Phase II and in preparation for new projects</p>
<p><b>In relation to programme objective 2: build the capacity of trade support institutions to support businesswomen</b></p>		
<p>4. The Programme should strengthen the sustainability and exit strategies for projects implemented in countries, for example, through training the trainers within TSIs, ownership and partnership arrangements with national partners, and replication and scaling up projects. The exit strategy should</p>	<p><i>Para. 11. Building the capacity of TSIs ensured that some were able to continue the work when the ITC project ended, especially for the Platform project. The Platform meetings allowed ITC to use its considerable weight to create opportunities for women entrepreneurs – from awareness to trade. Sustainability would have been strengthened if the projects</i></p>	<p>During Phase II and in preparation for new projects</p>

<p>be integrated in project designs.</p>	<p><i>had had stronger exit strategies, so that partners knew what was expected after ITC left, and had a clear plan of how to sustain support.</i></p>	
<p>5. Corresponding to the ITC results framework, the Programme need to include baseline data for each project and revise performance indicators accordingly, going beyond measurement of how many WBEs are targeted as beneficiaries, so that to measure the results further along the results chain and the sustainability of benefits.</p>	<p><i>Para. 9. The PCR reported that 1,198 WBEs improved their skills against a target of 2000. However the evaluators were unable to verify the performance indicators and only obtained anecdotal evidence of impact on WBEs. ... Impact on WBEs would have been easier to evaluate had ITC put in place systematic and transparent baseline and monitoring data.</i></p>	<p>During Phase II and in preparation for new projects</p>
<p><b>In relation to programme objective 3: strengthen the competitiveness of women entrepreneurs</b></p>		
<p>6. For projects in countries, the project identification and project appraisal should clarify whether a project is intended to serve as a pilot and demonstration project and, if it is, a plan for replication and scaling up should be included.</p>	<p><i>Para 13. The plan to replicate and scale up innovations was not explicit. In design, it was unclear whether the in-country projects were intended as demonstration projects so that the innovations could be replicated and scaled up. In some sense, they must have been, given ITC's pioneering role and the small budget size for each project. However, project plans did not include the necessary actions to serve for replication and scaling up. The observation of ongoing Phase II activities showed that this weakness is being addressed in the Phase II to certain extent.</i></p>	<p>During Phase II and in preparation for new projects</p>
<p>7. In consideration of the small size of the projects in countries, the Programme should review the targeting approach including WBE selection approach, to move away from the general and spatially dispersed approach to one that are more spatially concentrated and focusing on WBEs in great need and able to take advantage of project support.</p>	<p><i>Para. 10. The efficiency would have been strengthened if the selection of WBEs were with greater focus on spatial concentration and on those clients able to work with TSIs, so that participants were better able to access the services offered and continue with peer structures and support.</i></p>	<p>During Phase II and in preparation for new projects</p>
<p>8. In line with ITC's ongoing efforts in enhancing corporate monitoring and evaluation</p>	<p><i>Para. 9. Impact on WBEs would have been easier to evaluate had ITC put in place systematic and</i></p>	<p>During Phase II and in preparation for</p>

<p>systems, the Programme should strengthen the monitoring and evaluation system at both programme and project levels, to include baseline report, progress reports including WBE performance, and systematic measurement and reporting of results.</p>	<p><i>transparent baseline and monitoring data.</i></p> <p><i>Para 10. The evaluation could not make a conclusive judgment on the efficiency of the programme due to the lack of data for conducting a cost-benefit analysis.</i></p>	<p>new projects</p>
<p><b>In relation to objective 4: mainstream gender into ITC's policies, processes and activities</b></p>		
<p>9. Based on the experience of Phase I, the Programme should prepare an analytical report to facilitate ITC Management's decision on how to further enforce gender mainstreaming at ITC and in project operations.</p>	<p><i>Para. 8. Mainstreaming would be more effective if the ITC management had strengthened resourcing for enforcement in programmes and projects and related accountability requirements for all programmes and projects.</i></p>	<p>During Phase II and in preparation for new projects</p>
<p>10. Together with the analytical report mentioned in Recommendation 10, the Programme should prepare a results-based budget/cost analysis for ITC management decision on how to ensure the resources and measures for gender mainstreaming across operations.</p>	<p><i>Para. 8. Mainstreaming would be more effective if the ITC management had strengthened resourcing for enforcement in programmes and projects and related accountability requirements for all programmes and projects.</i></p>	<p>During Phase II and in preparation for new projects</p>

## I. Introduction

### Background on the programme

16. The Women and Trade Programme is one of the ITC's large programmes, with a total investment of USD 5.8 million, part funded by DFID.<sup>7</sup> The Programme also benefited from contributions from Norway and Finland and other governments through ITC's Global Trust Fund (Window I). Upon the completion of the 3-year programme (2010-2012), an evaluation of the Women and Trade Programme Phase I was requested.
17. The Women and Trade Programme intended to address the identified constraints on women entrepreneurs in developing countries in trade, particularly in export. The target groups of the Programme were women entrepreneurs, women-owned small businesses, and women working in export-oriented value chains. According to project documents, the objectives of the programme were to:
  - Influence programming and policy at the national and international levels, to address gender based constraints to trade.
  - Build the capacity of trade support institutions to support businesswomen.
  - Strengthen the competitiveness of women entrepreneurs.
  - Mainstream gender into ITC's policies, processes and activities.
18. The original vision document described the Programme as composed of four components, corresponding to the objectives:
  - Building the capacity of policy makers and trade support institutions to address gender based constraints in regional and national strategies, e.g. dissemination of diagnostic tools combined with training.
  - Building the capacity of policy makers and trade support institutions to support women in selected sectors e.g. development of methodology to address gender issues in export related value chains, using the example of coffee export.
  - Empowering women business owners, linking women business owners to international and regional buyers. A demand-driven approach was applied: identifying the goods and services sought by corporations and facilitating preferential procurement with women business enterprises as suppliers.
  - Mainstreaming gender in ITC's policies. This aimed to integrate gender into project cycle management, and it covered five work streams including programming, launching an ITC gender policy, introducing an annual gender audit, etc.
19. Within the 3-year duration of Phase I, the Women and Trade Programme designed and implemented six interventions including one gender streaming project and five projects in countries, which are:

---

<sup>7</sup> DBIS commented that the total actual budget was USD 5.8 million. The overall programme costs are given as USD 6.9 million. DFID's share of this was GBP 3 million or an estimated USD 4.7 million. Based on the documentation made available to the evaluation team it is not possible to provide figures of overall disbursement. In October 2009, DFID and ITC signed a MOU to indicate that DFID would provide support to ITC in the amount of GBP 5,400,000 (about USD 8 million) for a 3-year period. Of the amount, GBP 3 million was earmarked for the Women and Trade Programme.

- Training and other internal capacity building to mainstream gender in trade projects and programmes in ITC
- Global Platform for Action on Sourcing from Women to link women entrepreneurs, through their associations, with corporate and institutional buyers<sup>8</sup>
- Support women entrepreneurs in the coffee sector in Africa
- Support women entrepreneurs in the jewellery sector in Mexico
- Support women entrepreneurs in the textile and clothing sector in Arquipa in Peru
- Support women entrepreneurs in alpaca in Peru to enter the US market.<sup>9</sup>

### **Objectives of the evaluation**

20. In line with the ITC Evaluation Policy (2008 and 2015) and the evaluation practices of ITC and consulted with ITC management and the Programme, the objectives of the evaluation were to:

- Assess the performance and results of the Women and Trade Programme Phase I, and
- Provide recommendations for the future strategy formulation, project design and implementation of the Women and Trade Programme.

### **Scope of the evaluation**

21. To assess the performance and results of the Programme, the evaluation covers all the activities designed and implemented under the Women and Trade Programme Phase I, in varying degrees of detail depending on data availability, in the period of 2010-2012. Besides, the evaluation extends beyond 2012 in two respects: to measure longer term results and impact, and to examine the learning linkages between Phase I and Phase II of the Programme.

### **Methodology of the evaluation**

22. In line with ITC's Evaluation Policy (2008 and 2015) and the current practice of UN entities for independent evaluations, the evaluation assessed the performance and results against evaluation criteria: *Relevance, Effectiveness, Efficiency, Impact and Sustainability*.<sup>10</sup> Besides, the assessments on *innovation, replication, and scaling up* are included in the section on sustainability analysis.

23. The key questions to be answered in relation to each evaluation criterion were developed in preparing the Inception Report and could be seen in Annex Two. To address these essential questions, the main methods and tools used by the evaluation team for data collection were:

- Documentation review, with a list of documents reviewed seen in Annex Five.
- Follow up survey of staff who attended mainstreaming training; the survey and analysis seen in Annex Six.
- Survey of Platform TSIs; the survey and analysis seen in Annex Six.

---

<sup>8</sup> DBIS comments: The Global Platform for Action was not a stand-alone project; it came under the broader Strategies project.

<sup>9</sup> A list of projects and activities designed and implemented by the Programme during the period of 2010 to 2012 is given in Annex Three.

<sup>10</sup> Issues around Innovation are addressed in the section on good practices.

- Interviews with key informants e.g. Programme staff and representatives of other organisations involved in women's empowerment, donors and governments. A list of persons met in Annex Four.
- Country missions to project sites in Peru and Uganda. The fieldwork for Peru consisted of six interviews with local business experts, five interviews with Promperu, and eight WBEs. The fieldwork for Uganda consisted of 20 interviews with TSIs/BMEs and three with officials/consultants. Country case studies are seen in Annex Seven, Eight, Nine, and Ten. <sup>11</sup>

24. During report drafting phase, the main methods used by the team for data analysis include:

- Triangulation of the data from different sources including documents, interviews, observation in field.
- Aggregation and statistical review of survey data, seen in Annex Six.
- Country case studies to present the findings on projects implemented in countries, as seen in Annex Seven, Eight, Nine, and Ten.

### **Evaluation process**

25. As per the UNEG evaluation norms and standards and ITC's evaluation practice, the evaluation was conducted along six main phases, to ensure the quality of the process and enhance the quality of findings.

26. Preparation phase. The Evaluation Unit prepared the TOR for the evaluation, and procured long-term consultancy service with selected firms including Saana Consulting. Based on evaluation proposals, Saana was contracted for this evaluation, and it formed a consultants' team for the evaluation.

27. Desk review phase. The evaluation team reviewed the relevant ITC policies, strategies, programme and project documents, and interviewed ITC programme and project managers. An inception report was prepared based on desk review.

28. Mission and country visit phase. The evaluation involved country visits for data collection, verification, and appreciation of the current country policies and development context and trends. A mission memo summarising the key findings of the mission was prepared by mission members, and the findings are reflected in the Country Case Studies.

29. Report drafting phase. Following missions and country visit phase, the data was analysed and a draft evaluation report was prepared by the team. The Evaluation Unit reviewed the drafts and revised the structure and wording of the evaluation report.

30. Dissemination and learning phase. The Evaluation Unit will be responsible for interaction, communication, events, and learning throughout the evaluation process. Dissemination of evaluation findings and recommendations will be prepared and customized according to the preferences of key clients of the evaluation.

31. Follow up of evaluation recommendations. In agreement with ITC management, Programme management and other key stakeholder (e.g. donors), the

---

<sup>11</sup> The Saana team was unable to carry out a third planned mission to Burundi because of local conditions.

Evaluation Unit will follow up the implementation status of the evaluation recommendations.

### **Evaluation team**

32. The evaluation was managed by the Evaluation Unit and carried out by a team of experts of Saana Consulting through a long-term partnership agreement with the Evaluation Unit. The consultant/specialist members are:

- Annabel Jackson, Consultants' Team Leader, senior evaluation specialist,
- Petteri Lammi, Senior Project Manager, Saana Consulting, trade and evaluation specialist
- Amanda Shaw, trade and gender specialist
- Julia Lipowiecka, Research Analyst
- Joachim Eissler, trade and evaluation specialist
- Cissy Kirambaire, trade and evaluation specialist

## II. Evaluation findings and analysis: relevance

### Relevance to ITC's mandate, policies, and strategic objectives

33. The evaluation considered that the design of the Women and Trade Programme was consistent with ITC's strategic plan and strategic objectives during the period. The innovative nature of the programme provided added value to ITC's comparative advantages in the trade development field. Addressing gender equality and women's empowerment has been one of the cross-cutting concerns in ITC's operations. Before the conception of the Women and Trade Programme, ITC's interventions in supporting women in trade were more fragmented and less articulate in design and implementation. The Programme upgraded ITC's gender focus in its Strategic Plan for 2015-2017, which articulated a strategy to support women in trade: "ITC will continue to strengthen its Women and Trade Programme, working directly with women entrepreneurs and TSIs in selected value chains to help them capitalise on the opportunities offered by international trade. It will also continue to mainstream gender in all its work."<sup>12</sup>
34. In the trade development arena, in 2008 the Enhanced Integrated Framework (EIF) decided to incorporate gender approaches into the services it provided to the least developed countries (LDCs) and selected ITC as the partner to implement the projects.<sup>13</sup> This collaboration was extended through the Women and Trade Programme where ITC and EIF jointly developed a toolkit for mainstreaming gender into EIF projects. While gender analysis might not have been consistently represented across all the Diagnostic Trade Integration Studies - a needs assessment product prepared for each LDC as part of the EIF business process, this is now generally accepted as good practice.
35. For example, in Rwanda, EIF and ITC first piloted the use of the module gender and this is now considered by the Government a key tool for development in the National Trade Policy. Priority is also given to gender as a cross-cutting issue in National Development Strategies, i.e., the Vision 2020, the Economic Development and Poverty Reduction Strategy, the National Decentralization Policy and the National Gender Policy to promote gender equality and empower women to initiate economic activities and participate in trade, and to establish mechanisms to remove all barriers that constrain women's access to, and control over, productive resources.

### Relevance to the country needs

36. The Programme was considered relevant to the country needs and country context. The Project Plans for each project in Phase I referenced country level policies and relationships that supported the work. Relevance was enhanced by some consistency with national or international policies. For example, in 2008, the Peruvian Government launched a national strategy to support the commercialisation of alpaca products. At the time of the Phase I projects, the African Union, COMESA and SADC had gender policies. It followed wide consultations, and built on the work of other stakeholders such as COMESA, so that there was no duplication. Previous projects targeted large-scale traders, not the small and micro scale traders that were targeted by the Uganda project.

---

<sup>12</sup> ITC Strategic Plan for 2015-2017, page 34

<sup>13</sup> The Enhanced Integrated Framework (EIF) is a multi-donor programme with a budget of \$250m over a five-year period. It is the premier instrument for supporting Least Developing Countries to be more active players in the global trading system.



37. There is indication that some lessons learned from previous country operations were integrated in new projects. The project designs were built on previous projects that were complementary but not overlapping. For example, the Peruvian project was the only foreign technical assistance for the local alpaca sector at that time, but the sector had received macro level support from the World Bank, IADB and USAID, e.g. the formation of the Instituto de Peruano de Alpaca y Camelidos (IPAC), which had supported the larger players in the sector.
38. In some cases, the details of the design were less sensitive to the context. The fieldwork found that the proposed cluster approach, the *padrino* approach (detailed Annex Nine: Peru case study) was seen as contrary to local culture and more time was needed to make it work. The timing of the engendered National Export Strategy in Uganda was not ideal because work happened after the National Export Strategy had already been agreed; therefore budgeting and review processes did not encompass this additional element.

### **The relevance of the design**

39. There are some evidences showing that the Programme design and implementation benefited from lessons from previous work; the evaluation considers that the learning was informal and occasional rather than deriving systematically from management reviews and evaluations. Some of the training for the Mainstreaming project was developed earlier and absorbed into the programme's operations. Platform activities were specifically designed to ensure synergies with other ITC programmes such as coffee production and distribution, textiles and clothing. The Peru project built on ITC's previous five years of work funded by the Spanish Fund, which targeted the European consumer markets. The coffee project built on ITC's previous work: the coffee exporter's guide was first produced in 1992, before the programme, and updated in 2002 and 2011. ITC's early work on methodology for gender sensitising export strategies also contributed lessons to the development of the Programme.
40. The Mainstreaming project is considered having a strong logic based on ownership, high quality training, and adoption of gender-appropriate human resource management approaches. The intervention logic of the Platform project was based around actual business opportunities and deals rather than 'talking shops', with large-scale face-to-face convening and encouragement for buyers to make systemic changes such as collecting data on gender in procurement statistics, increasing transparency in tendering, making tendering more accessible, and setting targets for procurement from women.
41. The country projects had a moderately strong logic which assumed that WBEs needed a large range of support for export, and the export know-how would be enhanced when ITC worked in partnership with TSIs. For example, the Platform used buyer mentor groups to build the capacity of WBEs. To illustrate the broad and sustained nature of the support, the Textile and Clothing Sector group from Peru attended a study visit to Amsterdam and Paris in October 2009 and video training in December 2009 and January 2010, received support with product design in February 2010, participated in Peru Moda in April, reported new customers in July, tried sample production in August, produced a new marketing plan in September, received consultancy support in December, and also attended Pret A Porter Paris in January 2011 and Moda Las Vegas in February 2011. The direct contacts with international buyers were valued by project supported WBEs.
42. The indicators and objectives contained in the logframe were largely relevant and mainly measurable, but not all results-oriented. There were many output

measures and indicators, which simply showed that activities took place but could not speak to its results or impact. Outcome indicators tended to lack qualitative element, only recording that some kind of support took place. For example “Gender mainstreaming into ITC project quality and evaluation systems” is defined as one indicator, which belies the complexity of this objective. The PCR also acknowledges that project managers responsible for projects reported against too many indicators (page 15).

### **Relevance to beneficiaries’ needs**

43. The Programme was relevant to WBEs’ needs, but the targeting did not maximise results. The criteria for selecting women beneficiaries were general and broad. In Mexico, women beneficiaries were selected across wide areas but this seems to have reduced the chance for WBEs to collaborate and for TSIs to provide ongoing support. In Peru, women beneficiaries were selected because of their familiarity with local agency Promperu and to give a range of beneficiaries but this meant that some WBEs lacked the strategic direction, language skills and management expertise to take advantage of the opportunities especially the trade visits. In the Platform project, large corporates and governments were targeted because of the potential for high value deals, and so greater impact. However, the gap in need between these organisations and the micro enterprises that attended the Platform in its first iteration was so great that the Programme has since been adjusted to focus on larger SMEs and consortia.
44. Phase II addressed this issue in new projects. It plans to strengthen targeting of WBEs using a business generation tool developed by ITC to improve the match with buyers. The business generation tool was already used in a few cases in Phase I. The vision document for Phase II indicates that “despite the good support received from large corporations to participate in programme activities, the first phase demonstrated the existence of a substantial gap between the volume and quality requirements of large corporations from developed economies and the supply possibilities and capabilities of many women vendors from developing countries.”<sup>14</sup>

---

<sup>14</sup> Vision document, Phase II, page 8

### **III. Evaluation findings and analysis: effectiveness**

#### **Data challenge in tracking delivery results in countries**

45. The PCR states that the Programme met its targets for influencing national and international programming and policy; it is making strong progress on its objectives for mainstreaming gender into ITC's policies, processes and activities, and building the capacity of trade support institutions to support WBEs. Anecdotal evidence suggests that the Programme has partly met its objective for strengthening the competitiveness of WBEs, but the evaluation could not verify because of the lack of baseline or follow up data.
46. To assess the results against objectives, the evaluation faced a challenge of lacking systematic data on the delivery of the Programme. With the country projects, it is generally not possible to track what intervention was delivered, when or for whom. The evaluation team contacted some of the client WBEs but was unable to judge whether these were representative of the wider population of beneficiaries.

#### **Objective 1: Influence programming and policy at the national and international levels**

47. According to the PCR, the Programme met its targets for influencing national and international programming and policy. The Platform had a target of 22 trade development programme documents and 3 resolutions, declarations and other intergovernmental agreements strengthened to include references to gender equality or women's participation in trade. Both figures were exceeded, with actual figures recorded in the PCR of 33 and 8 respectively. However, the evaluators do not have the data to see if these agreements were translated into action on the ground.
48. The example of the National Export Strategy Gender Dimension of the Uganda Export was included in the Uganda fieldwork. ITC worked with the Uganda Export Promotion Board over five months and involved 200 stakeholders from government ministries, NGOs, universities and TSIs to give the government's export strategy (NES) a gender perspective. The final document was launched by H.E The President. In ITC target terms, this was counted as a success. However, the evaluation found that lack of funding meant that partners had not delivered on any of their commitments in the NES. At the time of the fieldwork, the UEPB had a database on exporters, but this was not disaggregated according to gender. This example illustrates the gap between indicator targets that measure activities and those that measure the follow through of activities.

#### **Objective 2: Build the capacity of trade support institutions to support business women**

49. The PCR reports that it supported 81 TSIs against a target of 108. TSIs were involved in the programme in three ways: the programme worked through eight TSIs on the Platform project; the programme helped set up ten TSIs to fill gaps in local delivery in target sectors, and the programme collaborated with local TSIs in four of the projects.
50. The programme reported that all client TSIs that the Programme helped to establish are still operating. Five of the TSIs that are working in the coffee sector in Burundi have transformed the way women participate in the market. All of the six TSIs that helped with the Platform project had developed their capacity as a result, in particular raising their profile internationally, strengthening their links to

international buyers, and enhancing their skills in making good use of the meetings with buyers.

### **Objective 3: Strengthen the competitiveness of women entrepreneurs**

51. The evaluation could not find systematic data on each business that has been supported by the Programme, e.g. their contact details, baseline performance, project end performance and follow up performance. Based on the country case studies, it was estimated that a fifth to a half of WBEs from country projects increased confidence, productivity and business diversification.
52. The Programme reports available to the evaluation team often quote a scale of impact without giving information on the number of WBEs affected, or the time period and sustainability of the change. For example, the Programme's publicity states that its work in Africa led to improved agricultural practices (e.g. pruning, better handling of the crop), which led to improvements such as reduction of post-harvest losses by 30 per cent, which resulted in women's incomes increasing by 20 per cent. A Hivos evaluation in Africa reported increases in productivity of 40 per cent, improvements in incomes of up to 100 per cent and increased quality. The International Women's Coffee Alliance identified increases of 23 per cent in premium quality coffee production.
53. The Uganda fieldwork found that the Coffee project affected 170 women and that the impacts were: increase in the number of women growing coffee, increase in the number of women exporting coffee, increase in quality due to drying coffee on mats rather than on the ground, and improved post-harvest handling leading to lower post-harvest loss.

### **Objective 4: Mainstream gender into ITC's policies, processes and activities**

54. The programme's targets suggest it has made a strong start toward mainstreaming gender into its policies, processes and activities. The target to train 10 per cent of programme and project staff in 2011 was exceeded (actual trained 27 per cent). The UN SWAP report for 2013 says approximately 53 per cent of programme staff received training.<sup>15</sup> The project cycle management (PCM) template was revised to capture gender issues and project gender content was reviewed against gender rating by Project Quality Assurance Group.
55. ITC also adopted flexible working, regular reporting on staff profile, inclusion of women in interview panels and inclusion of diversity issues in appraisals. The staff survey carried out by the external Independent Evaluation of ITC (2014) showed that women were relatively satisfied with work conditions. The baseline was that 24 per cent of ITC programmes and projects incorporated gender in 2010. The PCR said that 43 per cent of ITC projects reflected gender mainstreaming by the end of 2011.
56. The project built internal capacity for gender mainstreaming through delivering high quality training. The Mainstreaming project delivered training that was commented as systematic, analytical, detailed, tailored, participative and practical. It included ample opportunity to practice skills and think through the implications in case studies. In the follow up survey of trainees, to which 20 people responded, more than 70 per cent of respondents described the training as well organised and well structured. Learning was captured in a high quality manual. The manuals for external clients were customised for their circumstances and included up to date material. Attendance at each session

---

<sup>15</sup> United Nations System Wide Action Plan on Gender Mainstreaming and the Empowerment of Women (UN-SWAP)

was capped at 26. The training includes practical tools such as: a gender audit module for the Development Marker, PQAG project design templates, a project cycle checklist and a list of indicators.

57. There is some evidence showing that ITC staff put in the effort to include gender approaches in their work. For example, analysis of the mango value chain in Western African included a gender analysis. Analysis was also included in cotton and yams, which led to new projects in these areas in Phase II of the Programme. However, this take up is by no means universal.
58. The ITC Mainstreaming Policy acknowledged that women's organisations and women themselves were often marginalised from the consultation processes informing trade agreements, and states a goal to "incorporate women's input into consultations and project activities and implement projects in a gender-sensitive manner." However, the Policy, Project Plan and Action Plans did not making connections between consultation and processes for revision.
59. The main lesson from the Mainstreaming project was the need to sustain work over the long-term, which reinforced the value of including a follow on project in Phase II. Experience showed the difficulty in institutionalizing gender work and also the need to have a vision of how organisational culture should be led further, in addition to changing systems and processes. For example, analysis needed to take account of the effect of staff turnover, the culture of long hours, and the scope to extend paternity leave and other benefits to same sex couples. The overall conclusion is that ITC has not completed the task of mainstreaming gender. Mainstreaming is rightfully a long-term task requiring sustained effort.

## **IV. Evaluation findings and analysis: efficiency**

### **Programme and project management**

60. The efficiency of the Programme was enhanced by a strongly participatory approach. For each Platform, ITC surveyed buyers and facilitated surveys of WBEs to see which sectors were of particular interest. After each Platform, ITC obtained feedback from participants and acted on common suggestions for improvement. TSIs were also consulted in steering committee calls. The TSIs surveyed all described ITC as strongly collaborative. Each year, ITC surveyed buyers and WBEs to see which sectors were of particular interest for the Platform project. It also obtained feedback from participants and acted on results. However, TSIs helping with the Platform were not paid, which limited what they could do. For example, one TSI was unable to attend the second Platform event. The Platform structure facilitated interaction between ITC and TSIs, but didn't set a framework for collaboration between TSIs.
61. The Platform project also illustrates high quality of project organisation. In the last Platform, background material and sales pitches, themed by sector, were produced in glossy publications before the Platform convening, so that attendees could make the best of their time together.
62. An analysis of the timeliness of programme implementation was undertaken based on the data provided in the period requests for payment issued to DFID. These revealed that actual expenditure in a given period was between 60-70 per cent of the forecasted amount for the given period.

### **Cost analysis**

63. The overall programme costs for the Women and Trade Programme are given as USD 5.8 million. DFID's share of this was GBP 3m or an estimated USD 4.7 million. Based on the documentation made available to the evaluation team it is not possible to provide figures of overall disbursement.
64. A benchmarking exercise for the unit costs of outputs revealed the following. While the assessment is very light touch, overall the average unit costs of outputs would seem to be reasonable considering the operating environment. In the few areas where unit costs seem high (generally in areas where logframe targets were not achieved), supporting evidence can provide a more convincing picture (e.g. where the number of WBEs having met potential businesses was under 20 per cent of target, but overall value of contracts was surpassed by over 250 per cent). Further details are given in Annex Twelve.

### **Monitoring and evaluation system and the quality of data**

65. The Programme lacked a coherent monitoring and evaluation system. Rather, individual project officers kept their own records, which were not always shared through a central filing system or easily accessible by the evaluation. In some cases, projects failed to keep a record of when events were held, how many people attended or who they were. Individual projects sometimes carried out formative evaluation, but this tended to be of poor quality.<sup>16</sup>

---

<sup>16</sup> DBIS comments: Annual reports were prepared in December 2011 and December 2012 for the programme's constituent projects and submitted to the Programme Manager, as well as a comparison between the Peru and Mexico projects to learn lessons from the two projects in March 2012.

66. For example, the Platform project team collected feedback from participants but used open questions rather than a more systematic format, and the results were not analysed but rather each response was copied or listed. Formats varied somewhat from year to year, so reducing the scope for comparison. Where the evaluators were given copies of individual feedback forms, the lack of attendance data meant that response rates could not be calculated.
67. For the Mainstreaming training, trainees filled in short questionnaires before and after the training, but forms used two open questions and no analysis of this data was carried out. The evaluators expected to see project end reports with precise conclusions and numbered recommendations, together with follow up analysis of the implementation of each recommendation. These were not supplied and did not seem to have been produced.
68. Phase II of the Programme has learnt from these problems by including data gathering in contracts with TSIs. The Programme Plan specifically mentions the need to “develop a suitable system to capture and aggregate the achieved results.” Phase II has introduced an event diary system, and at the organisational level, by integrating monitoring with that for UN-SWAP.

## **V. Evaluation findings and analysis: impact**

69. Impact analysis is reliant on the fieldwork carried out for the evaluation because neither baseline data nor follow up impact analysis were available through ITC. Many of the estimates provided below are based on cross-checking documents and data collected in field, and by no means representative and comprehensive.

### **Social impact and capacity building**

70. The programme reports make claims of social impact, which are consistent with the project logic and what is known about implementation, even though the depth and breadth of impact is un-evidenced. These claims are that the Programme helped to reduce food insecurity by reducing the seasonality in income; increased women's income in industries such as coffee; and reduced domestic violence because of female empowerment.
71. The Peruvian Alpaca project illustrates the elements of social impact and capacity building, and the interconnection with economic impact. All the WBEs interviewed in Peru said their control over family decision making increased as a result of the changes in their business. None reported negative social or economic impacts. Before the project, only medium to large clothing manufacturers exported to retailers and boutiques. WBEs sold their products through domestic agents or NGOs, and had low bargaining power. The mark up from agents or retailers was 200-300 per cent. The Buyer Mentoring Guide said that, as the result of the ITC project, the WBEs concluded deals, increased sales, entered new markets, sold their own design collections and hired 200 more knitters and weavers in the area. These impacts affected some of the WBE's who participated.
72. The data from business advisors suggested that between 1/6 and 1/2 changed their businesses. The eight WBEs interviewed described these impacts: they developed new collections with new designs, changed colours to reflect market demand, improved quality control and tracking of sales, introduced technical sheets for the production process, developed marketing tools including websites, formed consortia, and increased their reliability. All said that the project increased their confidence and this was an important effect. However, only three of the interviewees obtained orders as a result of the project. An additional WBE received an order during the Las Vegas Fair in 2012 but did not have the capacity to meet it (it required 3,000 handmade pieces per month), which is consistent with the point above about relevant targeting of beneficiaries.

### **Economic and financial impact**

73. The target for the Women and Trade project was to raise USD 5.81 million through bringing together 906 WBEs and 563 buyers/governments. Figures in the PCR show that the Programme facilitated USD 20.8 million with 160 WBEs and 386 buyers/governments, which suggests that the project was efficient in targeting relationships likely to be successful.
74. Six of the eight WBEs interviewed in the Peru project said that their business turnover had increased between 2010 and 2014, with the percentage increase being between 10 per cent and 60 per cent, with four around 30 per cent. In each case the increase in turnover was matched by an increase in employment, with the percentage increase being 10 per cent to 40 per cent. These six businesses also increased their investment: they bought new machines and tracking systems and trained their workforce.



## Environmental impact

75. Environmental and climate change impact was generally covered in each project plan for the Programme. The case studies found anecdotal evidence of environmental impact. For example, International Women's Coffee Alliance (IWCA) said that the Coffee project had reduced erosion because of better farming practices. In addition, the essence of the Women and Trade Programme supported sustainability because WBEs are, on average, interested in protecting the environment.<sup>17</sup>

---

<sup>17</sup> Mentioned by UN Global Compact

## **VI. Evaluation findings and analysis: innovation, sustainability, replication and scaling up**

### **Innovation**

76. The evaluation finds that the concepts and plan of the Programme was visionary and, for its time, relevant and innovative. The innovations promoted by the Programme in terms of integrating gender equality in trade development and advocating women's economic empowerment are well recognized at ITC and by stakeholders in countries.
77. For example, the Platform work of connecting WBEs to international buyers through events, forum, business-generation tools, and other channels are considered highly innovative, especially in project countries. This kind of micro-level business matchmaking service is not often offered by other international organizations; it created visible value to WBEs in developing countries, and therefore it is highly valued by project clients and other stakeholders.
78. Another significant innovation is the commitment to shifting internal institutional cultures so that gender equality is seen as integral (and not competitive with) wider development objectives and as a normal and necessary part of staff capacity and program design.

### **The sustainability link between Phase I (2010-2012) and Phase II (2013-2016)**

79. As Phase II started in 2013, some of the project activities and benefits are extended with new project plans or replicated in new projects. The Platform project has been scaled up in Phase II; this project focuses on buyers which are medium sized rather than large, with the intention of reducing the gap between buyers and sellers. Training provided to WBEs has been increased to better equip them to meet buyers' needs. Partnership with and capacity building for local TSIs has been increased to strengthen ongoing support for WBEs and to improve data gathering. TSIs are being supported by guidance on good practice, and motivated by WBE competitions and awards. Global buyer mentor groups will be supplemented by smaller, sector specific groups, which will have access to additional online training.
80. The Mainstreaming project has been continued in Phase II. People First: Working towards gender balance across ITC, which has been integrated with work under the UN-SWAP, an accountability framework that sets out gender related targets and goals to be achieved by all UN entities by 2017. Besides, Phase II includes a quality advisor to work across the projects, responding to concerns about the fragmentation in the Phase I Programme.
81. Phase II also designed a project to capitalise on the positive experience of working with the IWCA in East Africa to extend these experiences to other coffee regions (i.e. West Africa) and other WBE intensive sectors.<sup>18</sup>
82. Five new projects are considered replications of Phase I operations: (i) The project in Nicaragua built on collaboration at the second Platform in Mexico. The ACCESS project, as it is called, is training the trainers on a 32 module course on trade related issues. The choice of Mexico was also informed by the Phase I project for women working in the jewellery sector. (ii) The project in Ghana on improving the competitiveness of women in the yam value chain developed out of the value chain analysis carried out in Phase I. One of the concerns about the

---

<sup>18</sup> Programme Plan, page 11

first stage was that the Council which was involved in the value chain mapping only included public sector employees and scientists, which has resulted in the proposal to recruit WBEs to the Council. (ii) The project on women working in cotton in Zambia is an attempt to apply the lessons from the coffee project to another sector. The project also benefits from ITC's global survey of Women in Cotton. (iv) The project in Ethiopia and Mongolia for women in the garment trade resulted from contact made during Phase I. WBEs attended the Women Vendors Exhibition Forum in Chongqing, China. (v) The Phase II project for women in trade in Palestine grew out of contact with a group of women who came to the Platform in Mexico.

### **Exit strategy**

83. All projects have some form of exit strategy in their project plans, of varying quality. Some good practices of exit strategy are seen in the cases: Phase II of the Platform project envisages creating an independent TSI to take over the day-to-day running of the Platform; and the Mainstreaming project has been integrated with work under the UNSWAP. The exit strategies were weaker for the Peru and Uganda projects, where local consultants said that the projects just stopped.

### **Benefits of the projects after completion**

84. The Programme made some arrangements to extend the benefit of projects beyond the end of the phase. In particular, ITC trained the staff of the EIF secretariat on gender mainstreaming, and some local networks shared learning. For example, the research on the Alpaca industry carried out as part of the Peru project was shared with a wider group of TSIs and WBEs; and the publicity materials created for WBEs during the country and Platform projects continue to be used after the project. The benefits from the projects could have been strengthened through greater focus on learning and dissemination of good practices locally and internationally.
85. There is no data on the resilience of WBEs to shocks or progressive exposure to competition. The Peru case study suggested that those WBEs who made improvements during the project continued on an upward trajectory after the withdrawal of external support.

## VII. Good practices and lessons learned

86. Based on document review, field visit, and data analysis, the evaluation identified some good practices which worth further study and replication in future operations:

- The Programme was committed to shifting internal institutional cultures so that gender equality was seen as integral and not competitive with wider development and trade objectives, but rather as a normal and necessary part of staff capacity and programme design. ITC Mainstreaming Policy stated a priority to achieve “a gender-balanced work force”.
- The Programme sought to leverage real business opportunities through the Platform. Experience showed that the WBEs selected were not always equal to the challenge of delivering on this scale; however, the approach was good practice in terms of potential impact maximisation.
- The Programme sought to integrate gender awareness into the planning of ITC’s trade development projects rather than retrofitting this analysis, although the intention was only partly met.
- The Programme was generally participatory. Especially for the Platform, TSI were consulted about their priorities and sectoral themes were adopted accordingly.

87. Based on the analyses abovementioned, some lessons are provided for the consideration of the programme management:

- A comprehensive programmatic approach is needed to integrate individual projects, and articulate intervention logic for the programme.
- Specific gender analysis in a given country context should be conducted for each project, which will enable the project to adapt to the situations and address gender concerns through customized designs.
- Beneficiary targeting should be more focused. For example, TSIs cannot reach all the geographically scattered WBEs for follow up support, and peer support among WBEs cannot be organised.
- Programme monitoring and evaluation systems must be developed to give a precise and shared picture of exactly which interventions occurred, when and for whom. Feedback collection should be systematised to allow comparison, on a quantitative and qualitative basis, between projects and time periods. Follow up monitoring must be carried out or included in firm agreements with partner TSIs.

## VIII. Conclusions

88. The evaluation considers that the Programme has largely achieved the objectives, although there are significant areas for improvement, and the ongoing Phase II has actually addressed some of the concerns, such as limited synergy among projects, weak monitoring and report, and lack of replication and scaling up plan. The value of innovation in design and in implementation is well recognized at ITC and by partners in project countries; the evaluation finds that the concepts and plan of the Programme was visionary and for its time relevant and innovative, and the programme team was hardworking and dedicated.
89. It should be noted that the evaluation process was often hampered by the lack of systematic data on activities, outputs, outcomes or impact. The evaluation carried out two field missions which provided anecdotal evidences but the validity and representativeness are uncertain.
90. Based on the data available and field visits, the evaluation could conclude that the Programme, by and large, met Objective I to influence programming and policy at the national and international levels, to address gender based constraints to trade. According to the PCR, the Platform had a target of 22 trade development programme documents and 3 resolutions, declarations and other intergovernmental agreements strengthened to include references to gender equality or women's participation in trade. Both figures were exceeded, with actual figures recorded in the PCR of 33 and 8 respectively. However, there is no data to see if these agreements were translated into results on the ground.
91. The Programme partly met Objective II to build the capacity of trade support institutions to support businesswomen. The PCR reported that 81 TSIs were supported against a target of 108. The fieldwork found that all the six TSIs supported by the Platform have developed their capacity as a result of project support, in particular in strengthening links to international buyers and enhancing WBEs' skills. The impact was less noticeable with the local TSI's evaluated during the fieldwork.
92. The Programme partly met Objective III to strengthen the competitiveness of women entrepreneurs. Based on the country case studies, it is estimated that a fifth to a half of WBEs in country projects increased confidence, productivity and business diversification.
93. The Programme made progress on Objective IV to mainstream gender into ITC's policies, processes and activities. ITC showed strong commitment to mainstreaming gender within its own operations. It designed and trained staff in powerful tools to integrate gender perspectives in project work. It embedded gender within its HR systems and reporting. More could have been done to give a vision of the intended organizational culture, and to make mainstreaming inroads at the project level.
94. The impact, especially the long-term impact, was difficult to judge because the monitoring systems at that time were weak. It also had a relatively cumbersome system of performance indicators which were sometimes duplicative and not always meaningful. As a fact, the Programme had a rich system of informal feedback designed at the project level to inform day to day operations, which is itself evidence of strong staff commitment on delivering results. The Programme would have benefited from a stronger monitoring and learning system: one that would ask the bigger questions about strategic objectives and long-term impact of projects.

95. The Programme was considered as highly innovative, but the plan to replicate and scale up innovations was not explicit. The replication and scaling plan is important for promoting ITC's innovations and realizing the value of innovation. In design, it was unclear whether the in-country projects were intended as demonstration projects. In some sense they must have been, given the small budget size and ITC's pioneering role. However, project plans did not include the necessary actions to serve replication and scaling.
96. The project plans provided detailed information about the mechanics of delivery; however, specific country context analysis was not always in place. With the benefit of hindsight, the Programme design should allow, in the future, a detailed contextual understanding of which project elements have worked well and in which situations. This contextual approach would avoid risk of treating women in a stereotypical or deterministic way, and would provide a framework for embedding action on economic opportunities within the social, cultural and familial factors that act as barriers and enablers. Individual projects have provided strong lessons about these dynamics, and it would be valuable to conceptualize in an iterative fashion at the Programme level.

## IX. Recommendations

97. Based on analysis and conclusions, below are the recommendations provided by the evaluation for the consideration of the Programme in existing and future operations.

<b>RECOMMENDATIONS</b>	<b>Related evaluation findings</b>	<b>Implementation timeline</b>
<p>1. Overall, the evaluation endorses the significant value created by the Women and Trade Programme in empowering women in trade for achieving ITC's development goals, and therefore recommends ITC management, DFID and other donors and clients to continue the programme to a new phase (Phase III) with particular objectives on contributing to SDGs 7 on gender equality and 8 on sustainable economic growth.</p>	<p><i>Para 4. The evaluation found that the Women and Trade Programme was pioneering, relevant and a credit to ITC. For its time, the Programme was highly innovative in development of practical tools for project management and mapping demands of women entrepreneurs, combined with gender mainstreaming in ITC operations.</i></p> <p><i>Para 8. The Programme met the target of influencing national and international programming and policy.</i></p> <p><i>Para 9. The Programme partly met the objective for strengthening the competitiveness of WBEs.</i></p> <p><i>Para 13. However, project plans did not include the necessary actions to serve for replication and scaling up.</i></p>	<p>During Phase II and in preparation for Phase III</p>
<p><b>Recommendations in relation to programme objective 1: influence programming and policy at the national and international levels, to address gender based constraints to trade</b></p>		
<p>2. Taking into consideration of the ITC theory of change approach, the Programme management should commission an analysis, based on lessons learnt, about the way policy agreements can be reached and framed to increase the chance of implementation, so that the policy advocacy will generate expected results.</p>	<p><i>Para 8. However, the Programme has no information on how or how often agreement is translated into action. In the one case where fieldwork was able to track the implementation of a policy agreement - the Gender Dimension of the Uganda National Export Strategy, it was found that the agreement was not transferred into action by national stakeholders.</i></p>	<p>During Phase II and in preparation for Phase III</p>
<p>3. The Programme should emphasize the contextual analysis of gender development issues in each project and each</p>	<p><i>Para. 15. The Programme design should also allow a detailed social, economic and cultural understanding of which project elements have worked well and in</i></p>	<p>During Phase II and in preparation for new projects</p>

<p>country context. With more nuanced gender equality concepts, the projects will be able further adapt to the situations and address gender concerns through customized designs.</p>	<p><i>which situations. This contextual approach would avoid risk of treating women in a stereotypical or deterministic way, and would provide a framework for embedding action on economic opportunities within the social, cultural and familial factors that act as barriers and enablers.</i></p>	
<p><b>In relation to programme objective 2: build the capacity of trade support institutions to support businesswomen</b></p>		
<p>4. The Programme should strengthen the sustainability and exit strategies for projects implemented in countries, for example, through training the trainers within TSIs, ownership and partnership arrangements with national partners, and replication and scaling up projects. The exit strategy should be integrated in project designs.</p>	<p><i>Para. 11. Building the capacity of TSIs ensured that some were able to continue the work when the ITC project ended, especially for the Platform project. The Platform meetings allowed ITC to use its considerable weight to create opportunities for women entrepreneurs – from awareness to trade. Sustainability would have been strengthened if the projects had had stronger exit strategies, so that partners knew what was expected after ITC left, and had a clear plan of how to sustain support.</i></p>	<p>During Phase II and in preparation for new projects</p>
<p>5. Corresponding to the ITC results framework, the Programme need to include baseline data for each project and revise performance indicators accordingly, going beyond measurement of how many WBEs are targeted as beneficiaries, so that to measure the results further along the results chain and the sustainability of benefits.</p>	<p><i>Para. 9. The PCR reported that 1,198 WBEs improved their skills against a target of 2000. However the evaluators were unable to verify the performance indicators and only obtained anecdotal evidence of impact on WBEs. ... Impact on WBEs would have been easier to evaluate had ITC put in place systematic and transparent baseline and monitoring data.</i></p>	<p>During Phase II and in preparation for new projects</p>
<p><b>In relation to programme objective 3: strengthen the competitiveness of women entrepreneurs</b></p>		
<p>6. For projects in countries, the project identification and project appraisal should clarify whether a project is intended to serve as a pilot and demonstration project and, if it is, a plan for replication and scaling up should be</p>	<p><i>Para 13. The plan to replicate and scale up innovations was not explicit. In design, it was unclear whether the in-country projects were intended as demonstration projects so that the innovations could be replicated and scaled up. In some sense, they must have been, given ITC's pioneering role and the small</i></p>	<p>During Phase II and in preparation for new projects</p>



included.	<i>budget size for each project. However, project plans did not include the necessary actions to serve for replication and scaling up. The observation of ongoing Phase II activities showed that this weakness is being addressed in the Phase II to certain extent.</i>	
7. In consideration of the small size of the projects in countries, the Programme should review the targeting approach including WBE selection approach, to move away from the general and spatially dispersed approach to one that are more spatially concentrated and focusing on WBEs in great need and able to take advantage of project support.	<i>Para. 10. The efficiency would have been strengthened if the selection of WBEs were with greater focus on spatial concentration and on those clients able to work with TSIs, so that participants were better able to access the services offered and continue with peer structures and support.</i>	During Phase II and in preparation for new projects
8. In line with ITC's ongoing efforts in enhancing corporate monitoring and evaluation systems, the Programme should strengthen the monitoring and evaluation system at both programme and project levels, to include baseline report, progress reports including WBE performance, and systematic measurement and reporting of results.	<i>Para. 9. Impact on WBEs would have been easier to evaluate had ITC put in place systematic and transparent baseline and monitoring data.</i>  <i>Para 10. The evaluation could not make a conclusive judgment on the efficiency of the programme due to the lack of data for conducting a cost-benefit analysis.</i>	During Phase II and in preparation for new projects
<b>In relation to objective 4: mainstream gender into ITC's policies, processes and activities</b>		
9. Based on the experience of Phase I, the Programme should prepare an analytical report to facilitate ITC Management's decision on how to further enforce gender mainstreaming at ITC and in project operations.	<i>Para. 8. Mainstreaming would be more effective if the ITC management had strengthened resourcing for enforcement in programmes and projects and related accountability requirements for all programmes and projects.</i>	During Phase II and in preparation for new projects
10. Together with the analytical report mentioned in Recommendation 10, the Programme should prepare a results-based budget/cost analysis for ITC management decision on how to ensure the	<i>Para. 8. Mainstreaming would be more effective if the ITC management had strengthened resourcing for enforcement in programmes and projects and related accountability requirements for all programmes and projects.</i>	During Phase II and in preparation for new projects

resources and measures for gender mainstreaming across operations.		
--	--	--

## ANNEX ONE: TERMS OF REFERENCE

Separate document

### Annex Two: Key questions from the Inception Report

Question	Evidence	Remarks
<b>RELEVANCE</b>		
Are the strategic objectives of the Programme consistent with ITC's mandate, policies, and strategic objectives?	Review of strategy documents, and project documents	Straightforward.
Did the Programme contribute to a comparative advantage of ITC in the trade and women's empowerment field?	Interviews with ITC staff, other experts involved in the women's empowerment field, benchmarking	The evaluation will give a qualitative rather than a quantitative answer.
Were the strategies of the Programme and the projects geared to the achievement of the project objectives?	Review of strategy documents, and project documents	Straightforward in terms of analysing programme logic.
Were the indicators and objectives contained in the logframe relevant and measurable?	Review of logframe and indicators	Straightforward.
Was the targeting relevant to the objectives? What were the criteria for selecting women beneficiaries?	Activities questions in case studies, documentary review	The evaluation will give a partial and retrospective answer.
Was the programme/project design participatory in the sense that it took into consideration the inputs and needs of key stakeholders?	Partner interviews in case studies	The evaluation will give a partial and retrospective answer.
Was the programme relevant to the country context: did it fit in with the country trade/export and women's policies and programmes?	Context review in case studies, review of project plans	The evaluation will give a broad answer from project plans, which cover this well.
Did the programme design and implementation benefit from available knowledge including previous evaluations?	ITC staff interviews	Already well evidenced, but probably under-estimates the full value because of time lags.
What are the factors that contribute to a positive or negative assessment of relevance?	Synthesis	The evaluation will give a qualitative answer rather than one from statistical analysis.
<b>EFFECTIVENESS</b>		
To what extent have the four main objectives of the Programme been attained both in quantitative and qualitative terms?	Synthesis	The evaluation will give a partial answer for the elements of the project for which there is available information.
To what extent have the objectives of the individual projects been achieved in quantitative and qualitative terms?	Synthesis	The evaluation will give a partial answer for the elements of the project for which there is information.
What factors in programme/project design and implementation account for the estimated results in terms of effectiveness?	Synthesis	The evaluation will give a partial answer for the elements of the project for which there is available information.
In particular, what changes in the overall context (e.g. ITC and country policy framework, political situation, institutional	Answer this for case studies only	The evaluation will give a partial answer for the elements of the project for which there is

set-up, economic shocks, civil unrest) have affected or are likely to affect the implementation and overall results?		available information.
Were there any problems or constraints encountered during the implementation of the Programme?	Case studies, documentary review	Already well evidenced, but analysis will probably underestimate the challenges because of time lags.
<b>EFFICIENCY</b>		
In quantitative terms, what are the costs to develop specific programme outputs (e.g. the cost of supporting women entrepreneurs in exporting local products)? The quality of outputs and results needs to be explicitly recognised.	Synthesis with analysis of costs and benchmarking	Straightforward, subject to accurate cost data being available.
Were the costs comparable to international or national benchmarks?	Benchmarking	Straightforward, although the benchmarking is naturally comparing programmes that are rather different.
Were the Programme and project activities completed on time?	Documentary review	The evaluation does not yet have a source to answer this question.
Was the monitoring and evaluation system properly designed and implemented?	Documentary review, interviews with ITC staff and TSIs	Straightforward.
Were the data collected reliable and complete?	Documentary review, interviews with ITC staff and TSIs	Straightforward.
Was the information generated from the M&E system used in management analysis and decisions?	Documentary review, interviews with ITC staff and TSIs	Straightforward.
What are the key factors that account for Programme efficiency?	Synthesis, including examples from the case studies	The evaluation will give a general, theoretical answer. There are aspects of the theory of change that very much imply high efficiency.
<b>IMPACT</b>		
To what extent have women entrepreneurs benefited from the Programme?	Documentary review, interviews with WBEs	The evaluation will give a partial answer for the elements of the project for which there is available information.
What are the social and economic benefits and disbenefits of the Programme?	Interviews with WBEs	The evaluation will quantify some aspects of the direct impacts and produce a model diagram to illustrate indirect impacts.
Is the national policy and institutional environment more conducive to supporting WBEs in export and other trade-related activities and to gender equality?	Documentary review, interview with ITC staff, case studies	The evaluation will give a partial answer for the elements of the project for which there is available information.
In quantitative and qualitative terms, to what extent has support to WBES contributed to poverty reduction in households and the region?	Surveys of WBEs in case studies	The evaluation will include a proxy question in interviews with WBES, but this will only give an indicative answer. The evaluation will also refer to other resource showing the link between WBEs and poverty reduction.
What are the key external factors that affected ITC's impact on the ground in	Synthesis, interviews with ITC staff	The evaluation will give a qualitative answer rather than

servicing the needs of developing countries?		one from multivariate statistical analysis.
What are the key internal factors at ITC and Programme management level that strengthen ITC's comparative advantage and impact on the ground?	Synthesis, interviews with ITC staff	The evaluation will give a qualitative and retrospective answer rather than one from multivariate statistical analysis.
What are the unintended impacts from the Programme?	Synthesis	This is included in q24.
<b>SUSTAINABILITY</b>		
Is environmental and climate change impact taken into account in operations in countries?	Analysis of project plans	The evaluation will give an analysis of types of impacts.
To what extent will the second phase programme (2013-2016) continue or enhance the sustainability of the first phase (2010-2012)?	Synthesis, documentary review, interviews with staff	The evaluation will report on the links between the two programmes. It will not predict impacts for the second phase programme.
Was a specific exit strategy prepared and agreed upon by key partners?	Documentary review, interviews with TSIs	The answer will depend on the response rate to the proposed survey of TSIs.
To what extent have the TSIs, TPOs and women's trade/export associations supported by the interventions increased their capacity and priority to support women and trade development?	Documentary review, interviews with TSIs	. There are three ways the programme has built the capacity of associations: through engagement with the Platform (for which a telephone interview protocol), in establishing new associations , and in building the capacity of local associations (which will be sampled during the two country studies).
Did benefits from the projects continue after the end of the project?	Case study level only	The evaluation will give a partial answer for the elements of the project for which there is available information.
What factors increased or would increase project sustainability? Note I deleted the last question as it was repetitive	Case studies and benchmarking	The evaluation will give a qualitative answer rather than one from multivariate statistical analysis.
How resilient are women trade/export activities to shocks or progressive exposure to competition and the reduction of external support?	Case studies, benchmarking and synthesis	The evaluation will give a qualitative answer rather than one from multivariate statistical analysis.

### Annex Three: List of projects funded by the Women and Trade Programme 2010-2012

No.	Title	Fund	Start	End	Allocation
RLA/58/07A	Peru: Strengthening the export competitiveness of women entrepreneurs in the textile and clothing sector in Arequipa	W2	03/2009	12/2012	\$435,501
INT/U1/22A	Consultant on Gender in Trade programme development	W1	01/2010	06/2010	\$146,272
INT/71/03A	Africa: Improving economic benefits for women in the coffee sector (Women and Trade)	W2	04/2010	03/2013	\$963,144
INT/71/04A	Women and Trade: Improving Gender Mainstreaming at ITC	W2	04/2010	03/2013	\$394,528
INT/71/05A	Empowering Women Business Enterprises(WBEs): Link to Corporate and Institutional Buyers	W2	04/2010	12/2011	\$356,527
INT/71/06A	Women and trade - Building the capacity to address gender based trade constraints (together with U1/97A)	W2	06/2010	03/2013	\$1,442,247
INT/U1/43A	Trade facilitation - Facilitating women informal cross border trade in Uganda	W1	07/2010	08/2011	\$316,933
INT/71/09A	Women and Trade Core Staff	W2	12/2010	03/2013	\$1,251,860
INT/ U1/62A	Empowering Mexican Women Business Enterprises (WEBs) in the Silver Jewellery and Beads Industry to Enter the US Market - ITF/W1	W1	06/2011	12/2012	\$273,707
MEX/71/11A	Empowering Mexican Women Business Enterprises(WBEs) in Silver jewellery and beads industry to enter the US market (together with U1/62A)	W2	06/2011	05/2013	\$226,550
INT/U1/61A	Empowering Peruvian Women Business Enterprises (WBES) in Alpaca to enter the US Market - ITF/W1	W1	06/2011	12/2012	\$378,215
PER/71/10A	Empowering Peruvian Women Business Enterprises(WBEs) in Alpaca to enter the US Market (together with U1/61A)	W2	06/2011	03/2013	\$170,588
INT/ U1/67A	Women and Trade Strategies: Chongqing Platform	W1	09/2011	01/2012	\$251,531
INT/ U1/97A	Women and Trade - Building the capacity to address gender-based trade constraints W1	W1	06/2012	12/2012	\$251,685
Total					\$6,859,294

## Annex Four: List of interviewees

Name	Position	Organisation	Location	Contact
PERU				
Mariela Lopez	Commercial Manager	Royal Knit	Puno, Peru	mlopez@rkperu.com
Beatriz Tomasio Ciadros	Director General	L. Paulet	Arequipa, Peru	<a href="mailto:beatricetomasio@hotmail.com">beatricetomasio@hotmail.com</a>
Mary Cecilia Ramos		NYMS	Arequipa, Peru	maryc_rm@hotmail.com
Sandra Huaman	Manager	Beauty Alpaca	Huancayo, Peru	administracion@beautyalpaca.com
Julia Huaman	Manager	Mantari Sweaters	Huancayo, Peru	sales@mantariknits.com
Valeriana Ordóñez		Inti Alpaca	Puno, Peru	
Maritza Pascori Calloapaza		Jomatex	Puno, Peru	gerencia@jomatex.com
Marcia Alamoca	Director	Tumi Mano Arte	Puno, Peru	artesanía_tumi@hotmail.com, artesanía_tumi@yahoo.es
Roxana Quispesayhua	Director of the Consortium	Consortio Textil Titicaca Itana Collection	Puno, Peru	gerencia@textiltiticaca.com
Ignacio Rivera	Head of PROMPERU Office in Arequipa	PROMPERU	Arequipa, Peru	irivera@promperu.gob.pe
Mariela Chavez	Promotion Officer, Promperu Arequipa	PROMPERU	Arequipa, Peru	mcchavez@promperu.gob.pe
Ximena Roman	Promotion Officer, Promperu Huancayo	PROMPERU	Huancayo, Peru	xroman@promperu.gob.pe
Igor Rojas	Coordinator Textile Industry, PROMPERU, Lima	PROMPERU	Lima, Peru	irojas@promperu.gob.pe
Maritza Bejarano	Promotion Officer, Promperu Puno	PROMPERU	Puno, Peru	mbejarano@promperu.gob.pe
Matias Urrutigoity	Programme Officer, DCP-OLAC Section	ITC	Geneva, Switzerland	urrutigoity@intracen.org

Ysabel Segura	Manager, Manufacturing Sector	Exporter Association (ADEX)	Lima, Peru	
Amparo Alvarez	Consultant, production design and product development		Peru	amparodesigner@hotmail.com
Gabriela Ruiz Mavros	ITC International Consultant		Peru	mgabrielarg@aol.com
Laura Sacchi	Designer		Peru	laura@klud.pe
Malena Alvarez	ITC National Consultant in Peru		Peru	malenaal@yahoo.com
Mariana Masias	Lecturer and designer	Instituto del Sur	Arequipa, Peru	marianamasias@hotmail.com
Omar Azanedo	Manager, TradeCenter	AmCham Peru	Lima, Peru	oazanedo@amcham.org.pe
UGANDA				
Angela Strachan	Consultant, former ITC Project Manager for ICBT project		London, UK	angelal.strachan@gmail.com
Ezequiel Guicovsky Lizarraga	Project Manager, ICBT Project in Uganda	International Trade Centre	Geneva, Switzerland	guicovsky@intracen.org
Magombe Jane Bella	President	International women's coffee Alliance- Uganda Chapter	Kampala, Uganda	jbmagombe@yahoo.com
Elizabeth Lukonji	Treasurer	International women's coffee Alliance- Uganda Chapter	Kampala, Uganda	
Phyllis Chemisol	Office Manager	International women's coffee Alliance- Uganda Chapter	Kampala, Uganda	
Kizito Mayanja	Principle Information Officer, Gender Focal Point, Coffee	International women's coffee Alliance- Uganda Chapter	Kampala, Uganda	mayanja@ugandacoffee.org
Joseph Nkandu	Executive Director	National Union of Coffee Agribusiness and Farm Entreprises (NUCAFE)	Kampala, Uganda	
Mowonge David	Deputy Executive Director	National Union of Coffee Agribusiness and Farm Entreprises (NUCAFE)	Kampala, Uganda	David.muwonge@nucafe.org;



Akoth Josephine	Former Chairperson	Busia Women Cross Border Trade Association	Busia, Uganda	akothjoze@yahoo.com
Florence Taaka	Treasurer	Busia Women Cross Border Trade Association	Busia, Uganda	
Helen Nabwire	Member	Busia Women Cross Border Trade Association	Busia, Uganda	
Madinah Namboozo	Mobiliser, Food and Vegetable cross border traders	Busia Women Cross Border Trade Association	Busia, Uganda	
Lucy Amuda	Member	Busia Women Cross Border Trade Association	Busia, Uganda	
Francis Emaat	HR Officer	Busia Women Cross Border Trade Association	Busia, Uganda	
Justus Obura	Clearing Agent at Busia Border	Busia Border	Busia, Uganda	
Officer Okongo	Police Sergent at Busia Border	Busia Border	Busia, Uganda	
Pauline Kirasha	Chairperson	Kabale Cross Border Women Traders Association	Kabale, Uganda	paulinekirasha@yahoo.com
Joyce Adrilli	Coordinator	Bibia Informal Women on Cross Border Trade	Bibia, Uganda	joyceadrilli@gmail.com
Kironde Charles	Marketing Officer	National Union of Coffee Agribusinesses and Farm Enterprises (NUCAFE) LTD.	Uganda	charles.kironde@nucafe.org
Jane Bella Magombe	Entrepreneur	Coffee farming and marketing	Uganda	jbmagombe@yahoo.com
Paul Gitta	Director Marketing UEPB and Coordinator of WICBT project	Uganda Export Promotion Board	Kampala, Uganda	gitta_paul@yahoo.com
Sam Karuganga	WICBT Project	Uganda Export Promotion Board	Kampala, Uganda	
Charles Nuwagaba	ITC Local Consultant		Kampala,	nuwagabamcharles@yahoo.com

			Uganda	
GLOBAL PLATFORM				
Elizabeth Vazquez	CEO and Co-Founder	WEConnect International		evazquez@weconnectinternational.org
Phyllis Johnson	President	IWCA		phyllis@bdimports.com
Lauren Gula	Manager, Social Sustainability & Women's Empowerment	The UN Global Compact		gula@unglobalcompact.org
Ursula Wynhoven	General Counsel Chief, Governance and Social Sustainability	The UN Global Compact		wynhoven@un.org
Malini Patel	Vice President for Economic Empowerment	Vital Voices		MaliniPatel@vitalvoices.org
John Priddy	Co-founder	Full Circle Exchange		jpriddy@jcllc.com
Virginia Littlejohn	President and CEO	Quantum Leaps, Inc		vlittlejohn@quantumleapsinc.org
COMPETITOR ANALYSIS				
Sevi Simavi	CEO	Cherie Blair Foundation		ssimavi@cherieblairfoundation.org
Dorothy Tuma	Director	DMT Consultants		dorothy_tuma@dmtconsultants.net
Laraine Mills	Private Sector Partnerships Specialist	UN Women		laraine.mills@unwomen.org
Simonetta Zarrilli	Chief, Trade, Gender and Development Section	UNCTAD		Simonetta.Zarrilli@unctad.org
Christiane Kraus	Chief Coordinator	Executive Secretariat for the EIF at the WTO		Christiane.kraus@wto.org

## Annex Five: List of documents reviewed

No.	Category	Title	Date	Author
1	Annual Report	Annual Report to DFID March 2012	2012	ITC
2	Planning document	Women and Trade Programme Plan		ITC
3	Planning document	Women and Trade Phase II Programme Plan	2013	ITC
4	Brochure	SPINNA Women's International Textile Alliance	2011	SPINNA/ITC
5	Brochure	Textiles & Garments Buyer Mentor Group	2014	ITC
6	Brochure	Empowering Women in Jewellery Supply Chains	2011	ITC
7	Brochure	ITC Women & Trade Programme	2014	ITC
8	Brochure	ITC Global Platform for Action on Sourcing from Women Vendors	2012	ITC
9	Brochure	Textiles & Garments Buyer Mentor Group		ITC
10	Brochure	Global Platform for Action on Sourcing from Women Vendors	2011	ITC/WECconnect
11	Brochure	Women Vendors Exhibition & Forum: Textiles & Clothing - Chongqing Sept 2011	2011	ITC
12	Brochure	Women Vendors Exhibition & Forum: Clean & Green and Automotive- Chongqing Sept 2011	2011	ITC
13	Brochure	Women Vendors Exhibition & Forum: Construction- Chongqing Sept 2011	2011	ITC
14	Brochure	Women Vendors Exhibition & Forum: Agriculture - Chongqing Sept 2011	2011	ITC
15	Brochure	Women Vendors Exhibition & Forum: Coffee - Chongqing Sept 2011	2011	ITC
16	Brochure	Women Vendors Exhibition & Forum: Trade Facilitation - Chongqing Sept 2011	2011	ITC
17	Brochure	Textile and Clothing Sector in Peru - This is my story	2011	ITC
18	Brochure	Textiles & Garments Buyer Mentor Group	2013	ITC
19	Brochure	Coffee Buyer Mentor Group	2014	ITC/IWCA
20	Brochure	Platform News Edition No1 - Women Powering Trade	2011	ITC
21	Brochure	Moda Alpaca - Perfiles de Empresarias Peruanas (Profiles of	2012	ITC/PromPeru

		Peruvian sellers)		
22	Brochure	Empowering Women in The Coffee Sector 2010-2013	2013	ITC/IWCA
23	Evaluation Report	Women & Coffee - Project interview guide/ questionnaire Saana		Saana
24	Final Report	Women and Trade: Empowering Mexican WBEs in Silver Jewellery and Beads to Enter the US Market.		
25	Event Documentation	Documentation from meeting of Coffee Buyer Mentor Group	2014	ITC
25	Guide	Empowering Women through Public Procurement	2014	ITC
27	Guide	The Gender Dimension of Aid for Trade	2010	ITC
28	Guide	Draft Outline of a Guide to Leveraging Public Procurement in Support of Women-Owned Businesses		ITC
29	Guide	Women in Cotton, Results of a Global Survey	2011	ITC
30	Guide	Strategic Orientation Document for Mango Value Chain in the Economic Community of West African States (ECOWAS)		ITC
31	Logframe	DFID Support to International Trade Center Logframe - Phase 1	2014	ITC
32	Magazine	International Trade Forum - Women & Trade (Issue 3&4)	2008	ITC
33	Project Completion Report	PCR of DFID Support to ITC - May 2013	2013	ITC
34	Policy Paper	ITC Gender Mainstreaming Policy	2011	ITC
34	Presentation	Report by ITC on Sourcing from Women Vendors to the WTO Committee on Trade & Dev July 2012	2012	ITC
36	Press Release	UK Support to ITC on Women & Trade	2010	ITC
37	Project Note	Women in the Coffee Sector - Establishment of Associations in Eastern and Southern Africa March – December 2010	2010	ITC
38	Project Note	Note for File - Mission to Houston May 2011	2011	ITC
39	Project Note	Note for File - Mission to Ethiopia to attend EAFCA/African Coffee Conf &	2012	ITC

		Exhibition Feb 2012		
40	Project Note	Note for File -SCAA coffee conf. and exhibition in Oregon USA April 2012	2012	ITC
41	Project Note	Note for File - Mission to Gabon to attend ACRAM Forum Jan 2013	2013	ITC
42	Project Note	MoU between ITC and International Women's Coffee Alliance	2013	ITC/IWCA
42	Project Note	Peru Project Change Request Form	2013	ITC
44	Project Note	Note for File - Participation of Peruvian Women Entrepreneurs in Magic Trade Fair	2012	ITC
45	Project Plan	Women and Trade - Building the capacity to address gender-based trade constraints April 2011-May 2013		ITC
46	Project Plan	Empowering Peruvian Women Business Enterprises (WBEs) in Alpaca to enter the US Market June 2011-June 2013		ITC
47	Project Plan	Project Plan Empowering Mexican Women Business Enterprises (WBEs) in silver jewellery and beads and to enter the US market May 2011-May 2013		ITC
48	Project Plan	Project Plan Gender Mainstreaming at ITC April 2011-Dec 2012		ITC
49	Project Plan	Project Plan Document Women in the Coffee Sector in Africa (Phase II) - Apr 2011-Dec 2012		ITC
50	Annual Report	ITC Women & Trade Programme - Headline Achievements 2011	2011	ITC
51	Technical Paper	National Export Strategy Gender Dimension - Uganda		Uganda Export Promotion Board
52	Request for Payment	Request to DFID for 6 monthly payment - September 2012	2012	ITC
53	Request for Payment	Request to DFID for 6 monthly payment - April 2010	2010	ITC
54	Request for Payment	Request to DFID for 6 monthly payment - Oct 2010	2010	ITC
55	Request for Payment	Request to DFID for 6 monthly payment - August 2010	2010	ITC
56	Request for Payment	Request to DFID for 6 monthly payment - April 2011	2011	ITC
57	Request for Payment	Request to DFID for 6 monthly	2010	ITC

		payment - June 2010		
58	Request for Payment	Request to DFID for 6 monthly payment - September 2010	2010	ITC
59	Request for Payment	Request to DFID for 6 monthly payment - Oct 2011	2011	ITC
60	Request for Payment	Request to DFID for 6 monthly payment - April 2012	2012	ITC
61	Technical Paper	Microfinance in East Africa - Schemes for Women in the coffee sector	2011	ITC
62	Technical Paper	Women in Cotton - Results of a Global Survey	2011	ITC
63	Training	Gender Mainstreaming Training for ITC Staff - Participants Manual		ITC
64	Training	Gender Mainstreaming in Caribbean Trade Policies and Programmes - Training Manual		ITC

## Annex Six: Data tables Staff survey

**Table 1: Views on the training**

	Yes definitely	Yes probably	Mixed	Probably not	Definitely not	Response Count
Well structured	8	6	4	0	1	19
Well explained	9	6	3	1	0	19
Memorable	7	5	5	2	0	19
Relevant to your work	9	4	4	1	1	19

**Table 2: Do you still refer to the training manual?**

No	75 per cent	15
Yes, occasionally	25 per cent	5
Yes, frequently	0 per cent	0

**Table 3: What do you see as the benefits of a gender mainstreaming approach for ITC?**

	Yes definitely	Yes probably	Mixed	Probably not	Definitely not	Response Count
Greater ability to target the poor	8	6	2	3	1	20
Greater investment in family wellbeing	8	4	5	3	0	20
Positive and transformative change of gender norms, roles and relations	9	6	4	0	0	19
Equity/addressing imbalances	13	5	1	1	0	20
Support to economic growth	10	6	3	1	0	20
Avoiding unintentional negative impacts	6	8	4	1	1	20
ITC being seen as a pioneer	5	4	4	4	3	20

**Table 4: What do you see as the barriers to gender mainstreaming in ITC?**

	Yes definitely	Yes probably	Probably not	Definitely not	Response Count
Lack of resources	3	4	10	3	20
Lack of time	1	4	13	1	19

Lack of agreement on priorities	8	4	6	2	20
Active pushback to prioritising gender	4	3	9	4	20
Lack of inclusion in ITC's performance and reporting systems	2	5	6	7	20
Staff overload	6	6	7	1	20
Lack of support from management	0	1	11	7	19
Lack of support from the board	0	1	8	7	16
Unwillingness of external clients to pay extra for gender analysis	1	8	6	4	19
Lack of capacity in TSIs	4	10	6	0	20

Table 5: Do you think ITC has done enough to mainstream gender and support women in trade across the organisation?

Yes	56 per cent	10
No	44 per cent	8

Table 6: Have you been able to integrate gender into any of your work?

No	20 per cent	4
Yes, already incorporated gender before the training	70 per cent	14
Yes, have incorporated gender after the training	20 per cent	4

Table 7: How high a priority should ITC give to gender mainstreaming?

Very high	30 per cent	6
High	60 per cent	12
Medium	10 per cent	2
Low	0 per cent	0
Very low	0 per cent	0

Platform TSI survey

Table 8: Were the Platform meetings well organised?

	Response Count
--	----------------



Yes definitely	4
Yes probably	2
Mixed	0
Probably not	0
Definitely not	0

Table 9: Were the Platform meetings useful to you?

	Response Count
Yes definitely	3
Yes probably	2
Mixed	0
Probably not	0
Definitely not	0

Table 10: Were your needs taken into account in the Platform meetings?

	Response Count
Yes definitely	4
Yes probably	0
Mixed	0
Probably not	1
Definitely not	0

Table 11: Did you, or someone from your organisation, attend the steering committee calls?

	Response Count
Yes	6
No	0
Comment:	6

Table 12: Were the Platform meetings special/different from other meetings you attend?

	Response Count
Yes definitely	5
Yes probably	1
Mixed	0
Probably not	0
Definitely not	0

Table 13: Did you have contact with the Women and Trade unit of ITC between Platform meetings?

	Response Percent
No	0
Yes	6

Table 14: Did your involvement with the Platform affect your organisation in any of these ways?

	To a large extent	To a small extent	No	Not relevant	Response Count
Raise organisation's priority to linking to international buyers	4	1	0	1	6
Strengthen your organisation's links to international markets	3	1	0	2	6
Raise your organisation's profile internationally	5	1	0	0	6
Give association members more confidence in engaging with government on issues	2	0	2	2	6
Enhance your organisation's skills in making the best of meetings with buyers	3	1	0	2	6
Increase your organisation's knowledge of members' aspirations and skills	3	0	0	3	6

Table 15: Did you encounter any challenges in helping your members sell to buyers at and through the Platform?

	To a large extent	To a small extent	No	Not relevant	Response Count
Difficult managing members' expectations	3	0	1	2	6
Difficult communicating across cultures	2	1	1	2	6
Difficulty matching the expectations of buyers	3	0	1	2	6
Logistics	0	1	3	2	6
Cost of travelling/attending	1	2	1	2	6

Table 16: Did you meet your objectives for joining the Global Platform for Action on Sourcing from Women Vendors?

	Response Count
Exceeded objectives	1
Met objectives	4
Fell below objectives	1

Fell far below objectives	0
Didn't have specific objectives	0

Table 17: Would the Platform have happened without ITC?

	Response Count
Yes definitely	0
Yes probably	0
Mixed	0
Probably not	0
Definitely not	6

Table 18: Do you see ITC as a pioneer in Women and Trade?

	Response Count
Yes definitely	5
Yes probably	0
Mixed	1
Probably not	0
Definitely not	0
Don't know	0

## **Annex Seven: Case Study on Mainstreaming**

### ***Description***

The original vision document gave this definition:

*“Gender mainstreaming is a comprehensive strategy aimed at achieving greater gender equality. This is attained by integrating a gender perspective into existing programmatic areas, policies etc. In the UN System, gender mainstreaming was defined and adopted in 1997. The official UN definition of gender mainstreaming is: “...the process of assessing the implications for women and men of any planned, action, including legislation, policies or programmes, in all areas and at all levels. It is a strategy for making women’s as well as men’s concerns and experiences an integral dimension of the design, implementation, monitoring and evaluation of policies and programmes in all political, economic and societal spheres so that women and men benefit equally and inequality is not perpetuated.” The Report of the Economic and Social Council for 1997.*

The document proposed a systematic approach to mainstreaming aimed at ensuring a common understanding of, and approach to, gender issues.

There were four main elements to the project:

### **Production of a Mainstreaming Policy**

The policy and accompanying action plan were approved by SMC in April 2011. The policy document mentioned the business case, the development case, lessons since the Beijing Platform for Action in 1995, and gave a conceptual framework around embedding gender in strategic measurement, mentioned the need for a gender balanced workforce, and gave five policy statements, committing ITC to make its strategic framework and performance indicators gender-responsive; train all staff; mainstream gender in all projects; undertake gender-sensitive reporting, monitoring and evaluation; achieve gender parity in staffing at all levels and offer a good work-life balance.

### **Inclusion in ITC strategy**

ITC’s Strategic Plan for 2015-2017 gave six focus areas, one of which was Promoting and Mainstreaming Inclusive and Green Trade. The Strategy stated that: “ITC will continue to strengthen its Women and Trade Programme, working directly with women entrepreneurs and TSIs in selected value chains to help them capitalise on the opportunities offered by international trade. It will also continue to mainstream gender in all its work.” (page 34)

### **Gender mainstreaming training for ITC staff**

Training was delivered to 83 ITC staff members, 40 per cent female and 60 per cent male, in five sessions in November 2011, January and February 2012.

### **External training on gender mainstreaming**

Training was carried out in 2011 for Rwanda and in 2013 for the Caribbean. The manual suggests this was very detailed, with justification, examples and practical guidance such as checklists.

This project was taken up by the Phase II project: People First: Working towards gender balance across ITC, which has been integrated with work under the United Nations System Wide Action Plan on Gender Mainstreaming and the Empowerment of Women (UN-SWAP), an accountability framework that sets out gender related targets and goals to be achieved by all UN entities by 2017.

## **Evaluation**

The **strengths** of the Mainstreaming project are:

### **A strong statement of commitment**

Lines of accountability and senior management involvement in the Project Plan were relatively clearly defined: "Senior Management is responsible for the approval and implementation of an Action Plan to guide the realisation of the policy, supported by the mobilisation of adequate human and financial resources" (ITC Mainstreaming Policy, page 11).

### **Strong institutional fit**

ITC's focus on women and trade was an excellent and appropriate niche area given the ITC focus on trade related technical assistance (TRTA) to small businesses. The areas of work around women in value chains, cross-border traders and female entrepreneurs represented a significant and well-communicated area of specialisation.

### **Twin track approach**

ITC was seeking not just to promote gender mainstreaming but also to adopt good practices itself, such as flexible working, regular reporting on staff profile, inclusion of women in interview panels and inclusion of diversity issues in appraisals. The ITC Mainstreaming Policy (page 8) aimed for "a gender-balanced work force" (ITC) through gender parity in ITC staff and gender-sensitive workplaces. Internal organisational change has been a notoriously difficult area in gender mainstreaming and thus a highly welcome priority in the strategy (Objective 5).

The staff survey carried out by the Saana evaluation of ITC showed that women were relatively satisfied with their work conditions.

### **Recognition of the need for consultation with women and women's organisations**

The ITC Mainstreaming Policy (pages, 4 and 10) acknowledged that women's organisations and women themselves were often marginalised from the consultation processes informing many trade agreements, and stated a goal to "incorporate women's input into consultations and project activities and implement projects in a gender-sensitive manner." However, the Policy, Project Plan and Action Plans did not make connections between consultation and processes for revision.

### **Early attention**

The aim was to mainstream gender on projects as they were developed or reviewed, not to retrofit. ITC's guidelines for project design were revised in July 2012 to include gender as a cross cutting issue, and an integral part of project design template documents. Projects under development are required to be rated for their contribution to gender equality and women empowerment directly (at the outcome level) or indirectly (at the impact level) and intervention strategies and indicators need to follow through on stated aims.

### **Statement of the business case**

A frequently repeated point is that: "WBEs have a greater impact on poverty alleviation as women reinvest 90 per cent of their earnings in family welfare (e.g. books, medicine and bed nets for malaria) whereas men only invest 30-40 per cent (World Food Programme). Programme documentation also refers repeatedly to the statistic that women constitute 70 per cent of the world's poor."

Respondents to our training follow up survey had a clear understanding of the economic value of mainstreaming: 80 per cent said that mainstreaming has the potential benefit of encouraging economic growth, the second highest perceived benefit after equity/addressing imbalances. 90 per cent of respondents said that ITC should give a high or very high priority to gender mainstreaming.

### **Prioritisation of staff capacity issues and delivery of high quality training**

The training was systematic, analytical, detailed, tailored to ITC, participative and practical. It included ample opportunity to practice skills and think through the implications in case studies. In our follow up survey of trainees, to which 20 people responded, more than 70 per cent of respondents described the training as well organised and well structured. Learning was captured in a high quality manual. The manuals for external clients were customised for their circumstances and included up to date material. Attendance at each session was capped at 26.

The target to train 10 per cent of programme and project staff in 2011 was exceeded (actual trained 27 per cent). The UN-SWAP report for 2013 said approximately 53 per cent of programme staff had received training.

The training included: a gender audit module for the Development Marker, PQAG project design templates, a project cycle checklist and a list of indicators.

One of the training objectives was stated as understanding the constraints women face. Examples, such as the case study on cross border trade detail harassment by officials, unscrupulous go betweens, delays at customs ports, lack of storage and overall threats to safety. AWID's critique of evaluation methodologies in development commented that evaluations should include a theory of constraints as well as a theory of change: "When you work for women's interests, it's two steps forward – if you're really smart and very lucky! – and at least one step back. In fact, it's often two or three steps back! And those steps back are, ironically, often evidence of your effectiveness; because they represent the threat you have posed to the power structure and its attempt to push you back. Sometimes, even your 'success stories' are nothing more than ways the power structure is trying to accommodate and contain the threat of more fundamental change by making small concessions."<sup>19</sup>

### **Application of training**

There is some evidence that ITC staff have put in the effort to include gender approaches in their work. For example, analysis of the mango value chain in Western African included a gender analysis. Analysis was also included in cotton and yams, which led to projects in these areas in phase two of the Women and Trade programme.

### **Integration of gender into performance measurement**

The PCM template was revised to capture gender issues, and the Project Quality Assurance Group reviews project gender content against gender rating. The Policy and Project Plan specially refers to the need to collect sex-disaggregated data (Objective 1, 4).

The **weaknesses** of the Mainstreaming project are:

### **Potential to widen the arguments**

The same powerful but rather out of date statistics were used repeatedly. Refreshing the arguments, and making links to labour rights, human rights and the environment, would deepen the project and strengthen its context. While human rights was mentioned as part of

---

<sup>19</sup> *Capturing Change in Women's Realities. A Critical Overview of Current Monitoring and Evaluation Frameworks and Approaches.* AWID.

the section on global guiding principles (ITC Mainstreaming Policy, page 6), these issues were not linked up with the development case made for gender mainstreaming (ITC Mainstreaming Policy, page 4). It is important to remember that Mainstreaming is a strategy to achieve equality, not a goal in itself. This point is implied in the statement in the Phase II Programme Plan (page 9) that: “While trade is widely recognized as an important contributor to countries’ growth strategies, it has also been recognized that export growth is not an end in itself and that export growth does not automatically translate into wider human development results.”

Overall the Mainstreaming project would have benefitted from a stronger and more critical analysis of causality and its contextuality. The Mainstreaming Policy (page 4) stated that: “women entrepreneurs are more likely to employ other women and purchase from women suppliers. This, in turn, could be said to lead to a virtuous engagement of women in the value chain.”

### **Potential to deepen the definition**

The gender analysis would have been more insightful if disaggregated by class, role or sector of work, caste, ethnicity/race, sexuality, and ability.

### **Need to strengthen evaluation**

The main project indicator used was ‘percentage of projects that have mainstreamed gender. However, the definition of this seems unclear. The training manual, (page 44), said that projects needed to identify gender at two levels to be considered mainstream, but the Gender Mainstreaming Policy used a weaker definition, that projects, ‘demonstrated any gender dimensions’. The DFID PCR in 2010 said that 24 per cent of projects had mainstreamed gender compared to 43 per cent at the end of 2012. However, it commented that: “most of this increase was due to existing projects reviewing their performance indicators to take account of their impact on women.” This could give the impression that the measurement was a paper exercise rather than a hard edged indicator driving or reflecting change.

Trainees filled in short questionnaires before and after the training, but these focused around two open questions: “Provide arguments for why gender matters in trade and economic development. Explain how you will mainstream gender into the design and implementation of projects.” No analysis of this data was carried out.

The main lesson from the project was:

### **The challenges in institutionalising gender work**

The Phase II project plan defines the challenge as “creating a more unified approach for the pursuit of gender balance at all levels of staffing.” (page 5) The Policy was strong on the changes to institutional processes and training current staff. However, mainstreaming also needs to think about how to change organisational culture so that gender understanding is normalised as a key skill area across the organisation. This might mean setting out a clearer and more compelling vision for what it is seeking to achieve and thinking about the enforcement of the Mainstreaming project; for example, whether gender analysis should change, interrupt or halt programs.

The DFID PCR also commented on this narrow view: “Outcome: Understanding that in order to be considered gender mainstreamed, project managers have *to clearly articulate gender issues and how they have been addressed throughout the document*. This means that as an organisation, continuity in ensuring that project elements related to women’s economic empowerment are *delivered as they were designed*; and that ITC is *able to influence implementing partners* to take into account the differential needs of men and women” (DFID

PCR emphasis added). Without quality criteria, these actions are insufficient to promote gender equality.

Only a quarter of the respondents to our training follow up survey said that they still look at the training handbook. One respondent commented that: "Training should be followed by coaching and/or installation of tools and methods to apply/force the learning into the workplace."

The main perceived barriers to mainstreaming gender in ITC were staff overload and lack of capacity in TSIs. One respondent commented that: "Lack of agreement on priorities is by far the main reason. If we have too many priorities that means nothing is a priority."

Only 54 per cent of respondents thought that ITC had done enough to mainstream gender and support women in trade across the organisation. Comments were: gender mainstreaming needs to be more deeply rooted in the project design phase, with clear guidance on what elements should be included, an allocation of resources to deliver and track these elements; and clear performance indicators; and that training should be repeated for new staff. One respondent also suggested that mainstreaming should focus on enterprises that employ a large number of women, regardless of the gender of the owner or manager.

Only 20 per cent of respondents said that they had incorporated gender into their work as a result of the training. 70 per cent said that they were already including a gender dimension, which could be because those most interested in gender were more motivated to reply to the survey.



## **Annex Eight: Platform and Capacity Building Case Study**

### ***Description***

The main element of the project was:

#### **Global Platform for Action on Sourcing from Women Vendors**

There were two trade events in the time of this evaluation: 2011, in Chongqing China and 2012, in Mexico City. A third was held in Rwanda in 2014

However, this was supported by five other activities:

#### **Membership**

As at March 2014, there were 600 buyers and more than 50,000 business and professional women sellers. Corporate members had an annual procurement spending in excess of USD700 billion. Signatories to the Global Platform committed themselves to: create shared value by sourcing from women vendors that offer competitive products and services; promote the benefits of sourcing from women vendors, educating multinational corporations on the business case and return on investment; share knowledge on policies and practices to increase sourcing from women vendors; support, initiate or improve efforts to integrate women vendors into value chains; and report to the Platform for Action Steering Committee on activities and impact via an annual survey.

#### **Awareness raising events**

These included: International Women's Day celebrations, Global Platform for Action on Sourcing from Women Vendors Roundtables for Corporates and Governments, Women Vendors Exhibition and Forum, World Export Development Forum, World Trade Promotion Organisation Awards, The Global Summit for Women, Chongqing International Investment and Global Sourcing Fair (CCISF), UN LDC IV conference in Istanbul in May 2011, and the UN Global Compact/UN Women meetings on the Women's Empowerment Principles, BPW International Congress Helsinki 2011.

#### **Training**

This had four components: training gender mainstreaming for policy makers, including training in gender sensitive value chain analysis; training and support for TSIs and training and support for WBEs. ITC helped establish Buyer Mentor Groups for Textiles and Garments and Coffee. Buyer Mentor Groups provide opportunities for WBEs to meet potential customers as well as attending business training and visiting retail outlets. ITC also trained the staff of the EIF secretariat on gender mainstreaming.

#### **Practical resources**

The team produced a Guide to Leveraging Public Procurement in Support of Women-Owned Businesses, and Empowering Women through Public Procurement, which was widely distributed.

#### **Monitoring, advocacy and communications**

ITC produced country reports analysing the gender dimensions of NTMs. The Platform project also had a communication strategy.

The PCR said that there was a target of 22 trade development programme documents, which was exceeded with an actual figure of 33. It also says that there was a target of three resolutions, declarations and other intergovernmental agreements strengthened to include

references to gender equality or women's participation in trade against an actual figure of eight.

## **Evaluation**

To obtain data on the Platform, the evaluators interviewed six of the eight international partner TSIs.

The **strengths** of the Capacity Building and Platform project were judged as:

### **Additionality/gap in the market**

All the interviewed TSIs said that the Platform events were special/different to other events.

This was because of: the convening power of ITC; the seniority of the corporate and other stakeholders; ITC's ability to influence governments and corporates about the value of supplier diversity; the wide range of interests brought together; the international nature of participation; and the focus on actual business connections.

*"The platform has a uniqueness to it as it bring together buyers and women owned company, NGOs and government. It is one of the few places I go where there is a synergy between all of those. Usually you go somewhere and the event is very local centric, but the whole world is at the Platform."*

*"The Platform is different because it tries to offer real live trade opportunities. Usually you attend meetings where the discussion is just discussions."*

*"They are so concrete. There are lots of conferences out there. But an actual engagement opportunity for companies that want to advance procurement. The Platform is a perfect opportunity to do business."*

All TSIs interviewed said that the Platform would not have happened without ITC. Five of the six said they see ITC as a pioneer in the field. Other economic or trade development projects for women have concentrated disproportionately on microfinance and small-scale commercial handicrafts rather than on helping businesses to export.

*"ITC has been a leading voice, if there is anyone who has helped to change the environment for these issues it is ITC."*

*"ITC W&T programme has got this issue of women and access to markets onto the global agenda."*

### **Leverage**

Working with large purchasers that already have policies around diversity but have difficulty making contact with WBE networks should mean that relatively little effort could release large investments. The vision document for Phase II of the Programme said one of the main lessons was that: "As ITC has limited resources, the alliances and partnerships developed through the Global Platform allowed the programme to multiply and expand its reach and impact during Phase I." The register of attendees shows that government buyers came from: Botswana, Ghana, Kenya, Liberia, Mauritius, Nicaragua, Nigeria, Rwanda, Saint Lucia, Sierra Leone, Uganda and the United States of America. The project notes for the fourth Roundtable argued that Government procurement markets equate to, on average, 15-20 per cent of GDP.

In practice, working with these large organisations brought other difficulties, as explained below.

## **Targeting at existing ITC areas of expertise**

Activities were specifically designed to ensure synergies with other ITC programmes such as coffee production and distribution, textiles and clothing. Following earlier experiences, ITC themed the third Women Vendors Exhibition and Forum in Kigali around coffee and services. So, in both this and the previous point, the thinking behind the project was around maximising efficiency.

## **Participative approach**

ITC had a commitment to reflect the views of buyers, suppliers, and partners. The project plan emphasised that projects should be led by the requirements of large buyers while also understand the limitations of WBEs and providing support to build their management, capacity and quality to meet those requirements.

Each year, ITC surveyed buyers and WBEs to see which sectors were of particular interest. It also obtained feedback from participants and acted on results. Evaluation questionnaires from 2011 showed a desire for stronger sectoral theming, more information on buyers and sellers before the meeting, more help with matching, and more time for buyers and sellers to talk to each other, all of which happened, to some extent.

All of the interviewed TSIs said that someone in their organisation attended the steering committee calls. All said that they had contact with ITC between Platform meetings. Five of the six said that ITC respected their needs during the process; the exception was referring to the lack of compensation for their financial needs, which is mentioned below. Similarly five said that they met their objectives for joining the Global Platform for Action on Sourcing from Women Vendors. There was an online recording of the calls so that others in the organisation could hear the debate.

Typical comments were: "ITC did a good job at bringing forward all the ideas and interests through the committee to. We had a framework for that." "There is a really great collaboration. The leader is such an incredibly dynamic person." "ITC is really dynamic and super open to collaboration. They are modern in their thinking. They are all about how they can leverage and make use of what others are doing."

The TSIs made a strong contribution to the success of the Platform and spread its impact. For example, one produced a note on inclusive sourcing and a webinar.

A limitation of the participative approach is that the TSIs involved in the Platform did not work together. There was no statement of common goals and shared responsibilities between these partners.

## **Strong organisation**

All interviewed TSIs said that the Platform events were well organised. All said that the meetings were useful. Several commented on the large amount of work that was achieved by ITC. A typical comment was: "If you look at the resources, it is done on a shoe string with a small number of really smart people."

For example, in the last Platform, background material and sales pitches, themed by sector, were produced in glossy publications before the Platform convening, so that attendees could make the best of their time together. The report for the fourth roundtable said that 450 applications were screened to identify those most able to benefit from the meeting.

## **Holistic approach to support**

The project plan mentioned that WBE needed comprehensive support because they have low export readiness e.g. seasonal operation, no contact with or feedback from international buyers on quality and trends, low technical skills to develop new designs, low use of CAD,

no marketing materials, and poor English skills (75 per cent did not speak English). The buyer mentor groups provided a package of support designed to meet these requirements. For example, the Textile and Clothing Sector group from Peru attended a study visit to Amsterdam and Paris in October 2009, video training in December 2009 and January 2010, received support with product design in February 2010, attended Peru Moda in April 2010, reported to new customers in July 2010, was helped with sample production in August 2010, produced a new marketing plan in September 2010, received consultancy support in December 2010, attended Pret A Porter Paris in January 2011 and Moda Las Vegas in February 2011.

### **High efficiency**

The target for the Women and Trade project were to raise US\$5.81m through bringing together 906 WBEs and 563 buyers/governments. Figures in the PCR showed that ITC facilitated US\$20.8m with 160 WBEs and 386 buyers/governments, which suggests stronger targeting on relationships likely to be successful.

### **Capacity building of TSIs**

The PCR said that the Programme supported 81 TSIs against a target of 108 and that 1,198 WBEs improved their skills against a target of 2000.

All of the interviewed TSIs said that the project built their capacity. All said it raised their profile internationally; five said it raised their priority to linking to international buyers; four said it strengthened their links to international buyers and enhanced their skills in making the best of meetings with buyers.

### **Expansion**

The level of participation grew from each event to the next.

The **weaknesses** of the Platform project Capacity Building were:

### **Overreliance on TSIs**

A couple of the TSIs were concerned that so much of the burden of organising the convenings fell to them, but they were expected to contribute all their time in kind. This placed a strain on them and also reduced the amount of work they could do. Interviewees generally wanted to have a far greater role in supporting WBEs, with a long-term strategic approach: "It is not realistic to expect the women to fund themselves. We were able to make the event more global by funding some of the women. If you want the Platform to be global then you have to fund it. This means thinking strategically about how to use the partners. We are in a position to prep women but need a strategic direction about what ITC would like us to do."

This criticism is the other side of ITC's strengths in leverage and partnership working.

### **Lack of follow up**

The vision document for Phase II of the Programme commented that: "Despite the good support received from large corporations to participate in programme activities, the first phase demonstrated the existence of a substantial gap between the volume and quality requirements of large corporations from developed economies and the supply possibilities and capabilities of many women vendors from developing countries." (p8)

One of the interviewed TSIs explained that: "You have a meeting. Everyone is enthusiastic. We might identify possible partners. Then ITC steps out and the gap between a corporate and women is left for us and them to deal with; and that gap is too wide. There is no follow

up by ITC. The women need more help.” Another one made a similar point: “Overall the Platforms were useful in raising awareness of what it takes to be a supplier, how to showcase yourself to buyers, how to document deals. But more preparation needs to be done so the women can take advantage of the opportunities. There could have been pre-meetings, webinars, and a chance for women to do research on the specific companies they would be meeting.”

### **Performance measurement and self-evaluation**

One of the indicators was “Number of senior government representatives that commit to exploring changes to government procurement policies and practices through participating in targeted events and meetings.” This is not a good indicator because it elides attendance at an event (output) with commitment to change practice (outcome).

Some events lacked basic evaluation data, such as information on how many people attended. This problem has largely been resolved in Phase II of the programme through introduction of an event diary system; and at a programme level, by integrating monitoring with that for UN-SWAP.

The fourth Roundtable notes said that Sex disaggregated data is missing, and is critical in order to design solutions, secure resources and direct these resources in a targeted manner. “UNCTAD is developing a new stats model and establishing baseline data in order to do cross country comparisons and factor as a part of inclusive growth.”

The **lessons** from the project are:

#### **Need for careful selection of location**

The TSIs interviewed commented that the three Platform convenings had quite different characters because: the Chinese authorities made a greater contribution, organising local tours and acting as a local catalyst; however, attendance at Mexico and Rwanda was more difficult for corporates to justify because of the travelling costs, insurance costs (especially for Mexico) and the lack of scope to combine a visit with regional branches (especially for Rwanda). One TSI commented that: “Rwanda is a very low priority, and that must have been reflected in the amount of business transacted. The volume wasn't there. The location should not be used to start the conversation, but to capitalise on opportunities that are already there.”

#### **Need for careful communication**

Without clear communication there was a risk that: corporates would send their social responsibility staff not their procurement staff, or their domestic but not their region specific procurement staff, or that procurement staff would not be prepared to share their standards or requirements; rules such as whether WBEs could bring samples/products were understood differently, leading to some feeling disadvantaged; participants or trainers did not understand the purpose of meetings or training sessions, or expectations vary. Communication is helped by developing templates e.g. for seller and buyer profile sheets, and having a schedule, with due dates when information should be provided.

#### **Need for careful matching of WBEs to support opportunities**

The vision document concluded that: “The organisation of buyer-sellers meetings demonstrated a large diversity in the capacity of women entrepreneurs to participate actively in business generation activities.” (p8) The success of the Platform depended on how proactive the participants are, which is outside ITC's control. As one of the TSIs explains: “It is very clear to me that the programme needs to be scaled up, and focused more on SMEs, especially mid-sized and larger companies, and NOT microenterprises. Also, more tier 1 and tier 2 buyers need to be represented, and more aggregators and integrators. Smaller

businesses have expectations of being able to sell directly to Fortune 500 and Fortune 100 corporations, and that is completely unrealistic.” The second phase project had a similar understanding: it says the work will: “Re-direct efforts to work with adequate buyers from regional markets, as well as other emerging markets that will ensure a better match with the offers from women entrepreneurs from developing countries, and hence incorporate a stronger South/South Trade dimension”. (page 11)

### **Need for ongoing support to WBEs**

The project plan for the Phase II project increased the involvement of local TSIs because: “These TSIs are closer to the target beneficiaries, bringing in deeper knowledge of the markets where target WBEs are domiciled, and could provide day to day support.”

The TSIs emphasised the need for further work: “Now the opportunity exists to move the programme ahead strategically. We need to have a rolling 3-year plan for regional and global events, and have Host Country Agreements in place well ahead of time with relevant countries so we do not get slowed down and derailed, as we sometimes have in the past (India). Also, successor countries can learn from earlier countries. We also need to do deep work with sectoral organisations to move outside of traditionally female sectors, and to provide capacity building for women business owners to succeed in these areas. It is also important that we engage aggregators and tier 2 buyers, in order to ensure more buyer-seller matches.”

## **Annex Nine: Peru Case Study**

### ***Description***

The project had these elements:

#### **Technical assistance**

This included market research, training, information, visits to the US, and participation in trade fairs. For example, 12 companies visited California to meet the Los Angeles Fashion Institute and to receive training on patterns, design and sales.

#### **Networking**

For example, in February 2011 six Peruvian women showcased their products during New York Fashion Week; in May 2011 samples were showcased to buyers (Topshop, TK Maxx, Aquascutum, Mothercare, Made BY, and John Lewis) in London.

ITC worked with Promperu, which had field offices in the three project regions. The United States was chosen as a target market.

In 2016, Peru will be the host country of the APEC Summit where women entrepreneurs will be one of the main thematic topics.

### ***Evaluation***

The strengths of Peru project were judged to be:

#### **Building on existing expertise and support**

ITC had already been working in Peru for five years, funded by the Spanish fund, although the target consumer market was Europe. Promperu provided support to the WBEs in the Alpaca sector, including through its exporter development program (ruta exportadora). The business advisors interviewed valued the mix of local and international expertise on the team.

In 2008, the Peruvian Government launched a national strategy to support the commercialisation of alpaca products. Alpaca represented 15 per cent of Peruvian exports. The sector has received macro level support from the World Bank, IADB and USAID e.g. the formation of the Instituto de Peruano de Alpaca y Camelidos (IPAC), which has supported the larger players in the sector. The project was the only foreign technical assistance for the local Alpaca sector at this time.

#### **Potential of the product**

The Alpaca sector has the potential to produce a high quality product, at scale, so generating wide benefit. The project plan says: Alpaca fibre is suited to high end products being lightweight with excellent insulating properties (7x wool), a large range of natural colours (25), and not suited to mass production; Peru is the largest producer of alpaca fibre (86 per cent of the world's total production, at the time of the plan); USA is the main market (37 per cent of total production at the time of the plan); the sector supports 150,000+ families along the alpaca value chain.

#### **Quality of support**

The evaluators interviewed nine WBEs at the Peru Moda Fair 2015 in Lima. This is not, of course, a random sample (interviewees are likely to be the more ambitious businesses). All said that the training met their needs and that they were satisfied or very satisfied with it.

The training was attended by the specific WBEs on the project, but also open to a wider group of businesses. However, this had the disadvantage that the large numbers reduced the scope for interaction and discussion.

ITC created short videos for its website. <http://wlsme.org/library/video-itcs-alpaca-project-peru>; <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=5iHMCbs8ke0>.

*“The market visits opened the minds of the WBEs and reinforced the technical training that they have received; many of them never have been outside the country.” Business advisor interviewed in Peru*

There were aspects with mixed results:

### **Reliance on TSIs**

The evaluators interviewed six business advisors who had been involved in the delivery of the project. One suggested that the desire for continuation should have been more explicit. For example, ITC should have helped the Instituto del Sur form a plan for ongoing support. Following the ITC project, Promperu embarked on a Fair Trade Programme, which includes a gender component, but it is not clear to what extent this was influenced by the ITC project.

### **Choice of USA market**

The United States was a good choice because it was the largest buyer of alpaca products in Peru (about 60 per cent of exports), and Peru has a free trade agreement with the USA. However, some of the business advisors suggested niche markets, such as the tourist market in Peru or European markets, might have been more suitable for the smaller businesses because of the greater scope to focus on low volume high price transactions.

*“I am not sure for example whether the Magic Show in the USA was the right trade fair to go to as it is a fair that attracts buyers that place emphasis on volume and price. It might have been better (in my opinion) to focus on trade fairs that target boutiques (smaller volumes, higher quality, better prices) such as the New York Gift Show in the US or the Ambiente Trade Fair in Germany.” Business advisor interviewed in Peru*

### **Cluster structure**

The plan was that emerging and advanced WBEs would work together (the *padrino* approach), with the latter making a financial contribution. The evaluators were told that the cluster in Arequipa had registered as a legal entity. However, interviews with business advisors suggested that aside from this, the structure was difficult to implement because it was contrary to local culture and more time was needed to make it work.

*“Much more support is needed to make the clusters successful. For example: the concept of cluster (even so this was provided more needs to be done in this area), how to structure and manage the cluster etc.” Business advisor interviewed in Peru*

*“In principle this is a good idea but much more work needed to explain the concept and much more technical assistance needed to provide support in the formation and management of a cluster. A presentation about the concept and its advantages is important but not sufficient.” Business advisor interviewed in Peru*

*“The concept of cluster still needs to have much more support in order to make it work in Peru. It is a good and valid concept but the time that needs to be allocated to make it work was underestimated.” Promperu*

### **Impact on WBEs**

Before the project, only medium to large clothing manufacturers exported to retailers and boutiques. WBEs sold their products through domestic agents or NGOs, and had low



bargaining power. The mark up from agents or retailers was 2-300 per cent. The Buyer Mentoring Guide said that, as the result of the ITC project, the WBEs concluded deals, increased sales, entered new markets, sold their own design collections and hired 200 more knitters and weavers in the area. These impacts only affected some of the WBE's who participated. The data from business advisors suggested that between 1/6 and 1/2 changed their businesses. The eight WBEs interviewed described these impacts: they developed new collections with new designs, changed their colours to reflect market demand, they improved their quality control and tracking of sales, introduced technical sheets for the production process, they developed their marketing including their websites, they formed consortia, and increased their reliability. All said that the project increased their confidence, and that this was an important effect. However, only three of the interviewees obtained orders as a result of the project. An additional WBE received an order during the Las Vegas Fair in 2012 but did not have the capacity to meet it (it required 3,000 handmade pieces per month).

*"The WBEs started to understand that it is important to follow a market driven approach and to produce according to market demands and trends. The market visit really opened their eyes and helped them to understand the importance of following market trends, understanding the buyer's requirements, having well organised internal processes, marketing, presentation etc." Business advisor interviewed in Peru*

*"The selection of participating companies should have been a project phase in itself and should have been conducted by a mix of people consisting of Promperu and technical/industry experts (who also know very well issues related to textile production, quality, design etc.)" Business advisor interviewed in Peru*

*"Out of the 12 companies I worked with, two developed a collection. The other 10 companies did very little or next to nothing. We need a filter to ensure that the right type of companies participate in these kinds of programme." Business advisor interviewed in Peru*

*"It did change a lot in me as a person. I am coming from a province and it has really opened my eyes. The exchange of information was very useful. Learning from each other was a very nice experience and to be exposed to another mentality (of teamwork and sharing information) was very enriching." WBE interviewed in Peru*

*"Before the program we supplied larger companies with our product as an input factor into their production. Now we have our own line and are exporting." WBE interviewed in Peru*

The weaknesses seem to be:

## **Planning**

Perhaps because of weak communication within or across local organisations, the overall vision for the project was not clear to everyone on the ground. Interviewees at Promperu suggested that if, for example, creating a brand was a specific intention of the project, then the work and budget to achieve this should have been more explicitly addressed.

*"What was missing was the following: structure, clear work plan, how to measure progress and impact, which indicators to use for measurement, a clear idea about the budget and how the budget has been allocated." Promperu*

*"At times the project was not well-structured and was more of a sporadic approach than a focused and well-structured approach." Promperu*

## **Weak evaluation**

Follow up is important because of the time lags for these kinds of systemic changes to take effect. As AWID say in their review referenced above: "Women's rights activists frequently encounter a disjuncture between change measures and time frames, for the simple reason that the changes we are trying to track may not be visible within the time frame in which we

are required to assess.” (page 14) “We need ways of conducting longer-term assessments to gauge how sustainable changes are, especially in the face of backlash. These tools should help separate short-term effects from longer-term change.” (page 21) The six business advisors interviewed could not comment on the impact because from their perspective the project had ended suddenly. One of the staff at Promperu thought that there should have been a stronger structure to capture lessons from the work, especially bringing the three regions together to share experiences.

*“It will be critical to have some sort of a baseline at the start of the project and also a monitoring system to measure the progress of the project. How do we measure the impact if there are no indicators? I am not speaking of indicating the amount of budget spent, the type of activities implemented, I am speaking about measuring impact and the chance that has been observed in participating WBEs as well as lessons learned (which could be very useful for any similar projects in the near future). As of now, we will be starting from zero again.”*  
Business advisor interviewed in Peru

*“The only aspect that nobody could really understand was the fact that once the project ended all communication with ITC also came to a standstill and that there was no follow-up.”*  
Business advisor interviewed in Peru

AWAID again: Evaluation frameworks should change during projects as outcomes develop. “Women’s organizations are also frustrated by the lack of a genuine and ongoing negotiation space with some donors for discussing what is happening with their assessment systems – there is a sense that once a framework has been negotiated, it becomes a very rigid tool with little space for modification even if the users discover that it is not working well or that new dimensions need to be added.” (page 15) The PCR (page15) mentioned the problem of project managers responsible for sub projects under the Women and Trade component reporting against too many indicators e.g. more than 20.

## Appendix Ten: Uganda Case Study

### *Description*

This case study refers to three projects:

#### **The Uganda National Export Strategy Gender Dimension**

ITC worked with the government to give its export strategy (NES) a gender perspective.

ITC has carried out similar assignments in Cameroon, the Democratic Republic of the Congo, and Burundi. Work included: consultation, training, technical advice, and help with drafting the strategy document.

#### **Support for Women in Informal Cross-border Trade**

This had six elements:

- Advocacy to harmonise procedures for women with those for men
- Advocacy to improve public awareness of the issues facing women traders
- Development of a platform to allow women to access resources
- Strengthening of networking among women traders
- Training of women on how to run a business, how to access technical assistance, cross-border rights and obligations
- Changes to on the ground practice: reduced time for women at points of exit/entry; respectful behaviour from officials to women.

The support for Women in Informal Cross-border Trade project related to four border posts: Bibia/Elegu, Busia, Katuna and Mutukula. The project was delivered in partnership with the Uganda Export Promotion Board (UEPB), the Ministry of Finance, the Ministry of Trade, the Uganda Revenue Authority Customs, Uganda National Chamber of Commerce, Uganda Women Entrepreneurs Association Limited, and local government.

Our estimate, from interviewing the associations, was that 153 WBEs took part in the project.

#### **Coffee project**

ITC delivered a coffee project, of which Uganda was one of the localities. This had three elements:

- **Training.** IWCA held sector specific training in March 2010, which was attended by 36 women and two men. In 2012 IWCA also delivered leadership training for 20 East African women. IWCA has also organised conferences, which disseminated resources to support production, innovation and commercialisation.
- **Support.** ITC supported a coffee buyers' mentor group linked to the Global Platform.
- **Trade missions.** IWCA organised a two-week mission for five East African women to meet coffee chain partners in the USA in October to November 2012.
- **Resources.** ITC produced a guide to microfinance in East Africa in the coffee sector, and a coffee exporter's guide.

## **Evaluation**

The strengths of the NES gender perspective project were:

### **High level endorsement**

The National Export Strategy was launched by H.E The President.

### **Participative approach**

The National Export Strategy Gender Dimension of the Uganda Export Promotion Board took five months to develop and involved 200 stakeholders from government ministries, NGOs, universities and TSIs.

### **Need**

The Uganda Export Strategy Gender Dimension (p29) said that at the time it was written only one in twenty exporters were women.

The strengths of the support for women in informal cross border trade project were:

### **Relevance**

The project was timely because it was the first such project in EAC at the time, and it was consistent with EAC's aim of regional integration.

### **Coordination**

WBEs interviewed said that the project was well designed and implemented. It followed wide consultation, and built on the work of other stakeholders such as COMESA, so that there was no duplication. Previous projects targeted large scale traders, not the small and micro scale traders that were targeted by the WICBT project.

### **Practicality**

The project produced documents such as an exporting manual – 'So You Want to Export', an illustrated guide on formal cross-border trade and how to transition from informal to formal status.

### **Capacity building of TSIs**

The project helped to create women ICBT Associations at four borders of Bibia, Busia Katuna and Mutukula. Our fieldwork found that these were still in place, and in two cases had expanded. However, the membership of the Katuna association had fallen from 50 to 36 members.

### **Impact on the WBEs**

The project reduced women's fear of the border officials. Although some women still crossed the border informally, the rate of WBEs doing so has reduced especially for Busia Border Post. The main people crossing informally are men, and women who are not members of the associations set up during the project.

The support led to the formation of companies after the project ended. For instance, in Busia, the women that had benefitted from the support formed and registered a company called JOWEVA Agencies Uganda Ltd, which is currently marketing and packaging products such as sour porridge, which they export to Kenya. The Bibia group had expanded to include men. In Katuna some of the members had gone into production of soap with support from EASSI.

Organising as a group meant that WBE could leverage additional support from NGOs, development partners and local governments. In Busia, the women benefited from further support from East African Sub-regional Support Initiative (EASSI) following the end of the ITC support. In Northern Uganda, USAID had a plan to support the maize exporters with training. The local governments also provided support in terms of training.

*“Women were not really organised before the training. Focusing on the women was a good idea because although both the male and females were traumatised by the war situation in the North, the men were more traumatised so the women were able to move on faster.”*  
Bibia/Elegu association interviewee

*“In Bibia, we have upgraded and are using better packaging skills in bags of 2kg, 5kg and 100kg, whereas before we would just carry a whole sack and start weighing from that side, which was much more time-consuming. We have increased our incomes from the increased market opportunities and also by saving the money we were using to bribe officials.”*  
Bibia/Elegu association interviewee

*“Though the programme was small it opened our eyes to think bigger.”* Bibia/Elegu association interviewee

*“We were greatly inspired to formalise and grow from trading one bag to trucks and trade competitively in the EAC market”* Busia Association interviewee

The strengths of the Coffee project were:

### **Need**

The training manual mentions that, in Uganda, women contribute 50 per cent of GDP, own 39 per cent of the registered businesses, but own only 7 per cent of the land and receive only 9 per cent of available credit. In the specific context of coffee, the project briefing states that 70 per cent of maintenance and harvesting work is carried out by women.

### **Building on existing expertise**

The coffee exporter’s guide was first produced in 1992, before the Women and Trade programme, updated in 2002 and 2011. ITC’s methodology for gender sensitising export strategies also predates the Programme, being developed around 2007.

### **Potential for far-reaching benefit**

The micro-finance report said that Ugandan Bureau of Statistics figures state that 25 per cent of the active population in Uganda is directly or indirectly employed in the coffee sector.

The fact that UEPB and other stakeholders have continued to support women coffee exporters to attend coffee trade fairs/exhibitions (in 2013 and 2014) shows continued uptake and hence appreciation of an initiative that was first implemented by ITC.

### **Development of TSIs**

International Women’s Coffee Alliance (IWCA) had 40 members in April 2011. The briefing note also said that IWCA members sold to Walmart, Accenture, BD-Imports, and WholeFoods.

NUCAFE already had a gender programme, and the ITC project strengthened this. In 2010, only one of the seven members of the management of NUCAFE was a woman, and that is now four.

*“The project was ground-breaking. The meetings of buyer and sellers were very impressive and a true eye opener for IWCA and its members.”* IWCA interviewee

## **Synergy between projects**

Members of IWCA attended the Women Vendors Exhibition and Forums in Chongqing in 2011 and the Mexico City event in 2012. The export strategy gender perspective proposed focusing on four sectors: crafts, coffee, dairy and tourism.

## **Profile of gender issues**

Producer Lesley Chilcott, who was involved in Al Gore's film *An Inconvenient Truth*, produced the film *A Small Section of the World*, about women coffee makers in Costa Rica. This used some of the statistics from the ITC about the lack of financial benefit to women from their labour in the sector.

## **Contribution to poverty reduction**

According to the ITC's publicity, work in Africa led to improved agricultural practices (e.g. pruning, better handling of the crop), which led to improvements such as reduction of post-harvest losses by 30 per cent, which resulted in women's incomes increasing by 20 per cent+. ITC's support also helped WBEs to diversify to reduce the food insecurity due to seasonality in income. Before the project most women worked unpaid since the sales process was controlled by the men. The Hivos evaluation mentions increases in productivity of 40 per cent, improvements in incomes of up to 100 per cent and increased quality. IWCA have identified increases of 23 per cent in premium quality coffee production. Hivos also found anecdotal evidence of reductions in domestic violence and other benefits.

In our fieldwork, IWCA said that, in the specific case of Uganda, the project affected 170 women and that the impacts are: increase in the number of women growing coffee, increase in the number of women exporting coffee, and improved post-harvest handling leading to lower post-harvest loss. Quality improved because all women in the association dried their coffee on mats not, as they used to, on bare ground (whereas nationally 70 per cent of women dry coffee on the ground). Some moved coffee to natural sheds around the drying area. Seasonality has been reduced because the women intercrop coffee with bananas, Irish potatoes, groundnuts, as well as dairy farming and handicrafts. Erosion has been reduced because of better practices.

IWCA said that coffee exports increased from 2,668,971(60kg bags) in 2009 /2010, to 3,499,839 (60kg bags) in 2013 /2014, (UCDA data). However increase cultivation has not led to increased profitability because of low prices and price fluctuations.

## **Potential environmental impact**

The PCT mentions the value of the coffee project for sustainability and environmental impact. P16

The weaknesses of the NES gender perspective project were:

## **Monitoring**

Short-term involvement of ITC means that monitoring of implementation of the NES stopped in 2010.

## **Low commitment**

The NES case study note said that lack of funding meant that partners had not delivered on their commitments in the NES. Our fieldwork found that the Gender NES had not been prioritised in terms of funding. Even though the document identified possible funding sources for each strategic objective, funding had not come in as anticipated.

*“Although responsibilities were clearly given, no specific manpower for the implementation or M & E of the Gender NES were earmarked.” Uganda Export Promotion Board (UEPB) interviewee*

*“The gender perspective document is not being used and the NES to which it pertains has expired.” UEPB interviewee*

At the time of our fieldwork, the UEPB had a database on exporters, but this was not disaggregated according to gender.

The Gender Global Entrepreneurship Index and Reports 2014 rated Uganda as a low performing country.

### **Timing of Engendering the NES**

Developing the Gender NES after the National Export Strategy had already been developed and approved made it difficult for the Gender NES to become a reference document.

The weaknesses of the Support for Women in Informal Cross-border Trade project were:

#### **Lack of ongoing support to TSIs**

TSIs need to continued support, to provide training to new members, if they are to expand.

The weaknesses of the Coffee project were:

#### **Gaps in support to IWCA**

IWCA interviewees said that they would have benefitted from support with setting up systems.

The Ugandan fieldwork does not show the coffee project at its best. The evaluators had originally planned to carry out a case study in Burundi, where the impact has evidently been stronger. This was cancelled for security reasons.

#### **Gaps in support to WBEs**

In the fieldwork, NUCAFE suggested that more work should have been done to support the WBEs with value addition.

*“Along the value chain, women still work as sorters of coffee because they are deemed more meticulous than men. This is a low level employment position.” Uganda Coffee Development Authority interviewee*

*“The programme was on the right path but the period was too short to attribute any changes in the sector to the project.” NUCAFE interviewee*

The main lessons from the projects were:

#### **Reframing gender around families helps to ensure buy in**

Hivos, in its manual above, framed its work with the coffee sector around families, to ensure that men understood and bought into the process.

*“You can talk of ‘women’s coffee’ in Uganda, but rather ‘family coffee.’” Uganda Coffee Development Authority and NUCAFE interviewee*

#### **Gender mainstreaming should fit policy windows**

Gender mainstreaming for national strategies such as the National Export Strategy should be integrated into the overall policy process during the design stage. A new Export Strategy

for Uganda is being developed at the moment, and this would be the best time to ensure that gender issues are integrated. Inability to take advantage of this opportunity is one of the weaknesses of short-term local projects.

**Support for women in informal cross border trade should be accompanied by effectiveness measures**

Although the project reduced women's fear of formal routes, it did not ensure the smoothness of the process. The intervention meant that more traders would be accessing the official exit/entry points creating pressure on the existing manpower at the border which did not increase proportionately (or at all). In Busia and Bibia, some women take several hours going through the border points due to the low levels of staff and the tendency of border officials to prioritise bigger exporters with commodities on trucks.



## **Annex Eleven: Working paper: ITC's Gender ITC Mainstreaming Policy: Strengths and Weaknesses**

*Amanda Shaw, Gender Expert at Saana, March 2015*

### **Summary**

Together with partners, the reach of ITC's Women and Trade work has been path-breaking in promoting consideration of gender-based constraints to trade and supporting women-intensive sectors' links to global markets. This section analyses strengths, weaknesses, missed opportunities and good practices in order to assess the quality of ITC's gender mainstreaming policy and project plan (considered together as 'policies'). It finds that these policies are mixed in terms of alignment with best practices. Major strengths include the niche institutional focus of targeted programming on women and trade twinned with internal organisational change. However, broadly, the policies miss the opportunity to bring together the business and human rights and environmental cases for gender equality in trade more substantively. Areas for strengthening could include deepening and formalizing connections with complementary areas of policy such as labour rights, clear lines of accountability and consultation with participant-beneficiaries and an updated conceptual approach to gender. Some key determinant of success – leadership, implementation and resources – could not be assessed from these policies alone and thus will need to be considered in the next stage of the Evaluation.

### **The ITC Mainstreaming Strategy and Program**

The original aim of the ITC Women and Trade programme was to enable women to derive greater economic benefit from participation in export-oriented value chains and improve women entrepreneurs' export competitiveness. This original vision has been focused down to understanding the demand for market opportunities for goods and services from women entrepreneurs, working with policy makers, trade support institutions (TSIs) and with women entrepreneurs themselves to enable successful conclusion of commercial transactions. In addition to work with women entrepreneurs and national, international and trade support institutions, ITC also aimed to mainstream gender into trade projects and programs through training and other internal capacity building (Output 5). ITC have taken the ECOSOC definition of mainstreaming which aims to integrate gender into existing strategic frameworks and performance indicators, including all programmes, projects and activities, reporting, monitoring and evaluation processes (ITC Mainstreaming Policy, page 1). The ITC policy also focuses on training staff in gender analysis, achieving gender parity in staffing and creating an enabling work environment for gender equality.

### **Evaluating Gender Mainstreaming**

There are several levels at which to evaluate the strengths and weaknesses of a gender ITC Mainstreaming Policy, its implementation and results. This involves analysing:

- The **big picture** of policy over time, in relation to other global policies
- The **technical quality** in relation to the program area of trade
- Changes to **institutional gender cultures**, including high-level commitment
- Programs' transformative potential and actual **impact**.

Specifically, in relation to technical quality this further involves assessing:

- How gender units are established, funded and able to influence and synergise with other departments and the organisation broadly

- How policies, programs and projects themselves are designed, funded, implemented, progress tracked and lessons learned
- The mechanisms and incentives for accountability and leadership
- The degree to which gender equality is seen as contributing to or competing with the drive for more effective aid.

This paper approaches these issues with a light touch, with space for deepening this analysis in later stages of review. The next two sections explore some of the broad evidence on good practices in gender mainstreaming and on gender and trade, before offering a preliminary assessment of ITC's written policy documents.

### ***Literature Review***

The fact that ITC's work has been innovative is exciting but also means that relevant literature about what works in gender mainstreaming in trade is limited, especially at the multilateral level. This review therefore blends good practices in gender mainstreaming on the one hand with some insights from analyses of gender, trade and development on the other.

### **Debates about Gender Mainstreaming**

There is ample debate about definitions and approaches to gender mainstreaming, given the wide range of tools, instruments and processes to which this label has been applied (Derbyshire et al 2015; Sweetman 2012; Brouwers 2013; Sandler 2005). Furthermore, there is no clear consensus on the best way of achieving gender mainstreaming, let alone gender equality outcomes and impacts through aid (Sweetman 2012). Many scholars are concerned about the ability of mainstreaming to 'reach' different audiences as well as how transformative aims can be lost in translation through institutionalisation (Moser and Moser 2005). However, it is widely recognised that progress has been made in the institutionalisation of gender issues in international agendas, although not always in ways that demonstrate strong aspirations for social transformation (AWID 2013, 2014; Mukhopadhyay 2014; Eerdewijk 2014; Wong 2012).

### **Gender mainstreaming as institutional change and sites of politics**

Some scholars have approached gender mainstreaming through the lens of organisational change, examining the **gendered nature of organizational practices, procedures, routines and cultures within development agencies** (Goetz 1997; Rao, Stuart and Kelleher 1999). Some have argued that it often appears easier for aid organisations to mainstream gender into programming than in internal organisational processes (Derbyshire et al 2015: 6). A recent report of the Gender and Development Network (GADNet) found that when technical processes of gender mainstreaming outperform processes of internal organisational change, technical processes themselves will not be institutionally embedded or sustained; however, when top level leadership and organisational commitment are in place to drive shifts in organisational culture, technical processes of organisational change come more easily (Derbyshire et al 2015: 7).

One review of the gender mainstreaming processes of UNDP, World Bank and ILO focused less on 'failures' than on gender mainstreaming as sites for the development of global gender politics (Prügl and Lustgarten 2006). Prügl and Lustgarten analysed changing meanings of gender and charted how these became aligned with, rather than shifted, the pre-existing objectives and approaches of the organisations. While their assessment (now nearly a decade old) is less than heartening, these concerns should be kept in mind in assessing the difference that gender makes not just in organisational processes but in overall organisational objectives, visions and goals. The views of the European Institute for Gender Equality (EIGE) perhaps have more practical purchase, allowing analysis beyond recognition of gender mainstreaming's by now well-known limitations: EIGE emphasize that

**promoting women’s rights and gender equality is a long-term, highly contested, complex political struggle** that takes place in uniquely different contexts (EIGE 2011).

At the same time, Benschop and Verloo (2006) caution about over-focus on internal gender mainstreaming strategies at the expense of changes in gender relations on the ground. Indeed, one of the biggest critiques of the literature on gender mainstreaming is the failure to create robust accountability mechanisms to women and girls themselves (Meier and Celis 2011). **Accountability** issues are particularly acute in bilateral agencies, who are accountable to their home electorates rather than only to beneficiaries (Eyben 2013) – issues which are further complicated in multilateral agencies, including joint agencies such as ITC.

### **A Gender Transformative and Sensitive Twin-Track Approach**

GADNet recently sought to re-emphasize the transformational aims of gender mainstreaming by highlighting the need for a “twin-track” approach that includes both mainstreaming and targeted programming for women and girls particularly. They propose a theory of change related to mainstreaming, whose ultimate goal is to improve the lives of women and girls. This goal must be pursued through “a set of gender sensitive and transformative technical planning processes, which should be systematically integrated into the organisation’s regular [...] policy, programme, project and departmental planning cycles” (Derbyshire et al 2015: 6). Indeed, many agree that a twin-track approach of both targeted and mainstream actions are necessary and that “externally focused and internally focused gender mainstreaming should progress hand in hand” (Derbyshire et al 2015: 6). In the first case, the GADNet report highlighted that targeted initiatives were more likely to be gender transformative whereas mainstreaming was more likely to be “gender sensitive” (Derbyshire et al 2015) and that mainstreaming cannot replace targeted support to feminist and women’s rights organizations (Derbyshire et al 2015). To be successful, they suggest that all systems of policy, project and process design integrate: sex and age disaggregated data; gender analytical information and; consultation and advocacy processes (Derbyshire et al 2015: 6). Critical elements for success include leadership, resources and training to underpin and systematically link the twin-track approach (Prügl and Lustgarten 2006) with appropriate plans, budgets and indicators of change (Derbyshire et al 2015: 6).

### **Good Practices in Gender Mainstreaming**

In sum, key elements of good practice include keeping in mind that:

- Gender mainstreaming is a strategy to achieve equality, not a goal in itself.
- Technical processes should involve dual track strategies of mainstreaming and targeted support and must apply to internal organisation as well as to external programming.
- High level leadership, organizational commitment and resources are essential components of success;
- As is genuine collaboration and engagement with women’s rights organizations.

### ***Key Issues in Gender and Trade***

International trade can exacerbate existing, and lead to new, inequalities through the gender-differentiated effects of unemployment and reduced income, affecting different sectors of economies and divisions of labour within households. Concentrating on how gender has been mainstreamed into regional, bilateral and multinational policies reveals little systematic evidence but ample material for consideration in relation to ITC’s approach combining the Women and Trade niche with mainstreaming. As such, research on gender and trade in relation to the impacts of trade liberalization, social and economic upgrading

and labour standards are several important spheres of research that can help to evaluate the effectiveness of ITC policies.

Considering gender within trade policy is a vibrant area of scholarly debate across diverse economic schools of thought. In order to explore some of the recent evidence on gender mainstreaming in multilateral trading organizations, it is useful to recap some of the current debates about the links between gender, trade and development that inform the evidence base and highlight knowledge gaps. These include issues in evidence generation, participatory and gender-informed policy processes as well as contextual issues that highlight the limits of what gender mainstreaming in trade can realistically expect to achieve. These include:

- The need for **gender research to inform all stages of the trade policy process and for more evidence** to understand the linkages between trade, growth, development and gender equality in a variety of contexts, including the differential opportunities and barriers for women working within global production networks and trade-intensive sectors. This includes the need to account for women's unpaid work and time burdens in analysing the impact of trade policy and for greater connections to be made between trade, economic growth and "complementary" (social) policies and public service provision (Fontana 2013).
- **Improving the accessibility of trade negotiations and policies** for civil society, women's organizations and countries of the global south in multilateral spheres, including through building the capacity of women's organisations to engage (Fontana 2013).
- **Monitoring the impact of contextual factors for how they shape gender dynamics in trade**, including the rise of South-South cooperation and regional trading blocs; the uncertain future for the WTO and the Doha Round (Evers 1999); rise in bilateral and regional trading agreements increasingly negotiated in secret and with strong multinational, corporate involvement (e.g. Trans Pacific Partnership Agreement) (Williams 2013).
- The limits of the neoliberal macroeconomic and trade liberalization **paradigm**, including mixed evidence on growth, development and wage convergence for gender equality, as well as on-going and increasing **wage and labour standard inequalities** (Van Staveran et al 2012).

### **Gender mainstreaming in trade**

A number of studies have assessed the **impact of gender on different trade policy options** through examining the gendered structure of economies and the impact on employment, income, consumption and unpaid work of various trade liberalisation efforts (Williams 2013; Van Steveran et al 2012; Fontana 2015). There is less evidence assessing the effectiveness of *gender mainstreaming* within multilateral organisations, but van der Vleuten et al (2014) argued that gender mainstreaming policies have been poorly implemented in EU, SADC and MERCOSur (2014: 222). Arguments over mainstreaming gender into the WTO governance structure versus focusing on engendering trade policies has been a key issue in international trade negotiations; UNCTAD, UN Women and the Commonwealth Secretariat have been strong supporters (Williams 2013).

### **Generating evidence and assessing policy options**

Gender mainstreaming in trade policy entails consideration of gender inequalities and implications at each step of trade policy processes, including, generating relevant evidence to inform decision making, design, implementation and evaluation of policies and interventions (UNCTAD 2014b). The evidence on the relationship between gender and trade

can be analysed through different lenses through microeconomic, macroeconomic, or sectoral approaches (UNCTAD 2014b), or better yet, through approaches which blend and link these levels and spheres (Fontana 2013; Williams 2013)<sup>20</sup>. Within this, there are different levels of gender analysis that range from gender sensitive understandings of existing gender roles, responsibilities and rights to more transformative work to promote change (Derbyshire Et Al 2015). It is critical that these inputs take place ex-ante (before), during trade negotiations and in the provisioning of development assistance upon completion of trade agreements (UNCTAD 2014b). Debate remains about the inclusion and effectiveness of social clauses/provisions in trade agreements as well as the effectiveness of labour side agreements whose enforcement mechanisms are often weak<sup>21</sup> (UNCTAD 2014b). These issues of **labour rights and social clauses** in relation to gender inequalities remain key areas to link with issues of gender mainstreaming in trade, acknowledging that trade policy space is highly constrained (UNCTAD 2014b).

### **Gender and Sectoral Support**

UNCTAD emphasise that efforts to gender sensitise trade policy should not be limited only to female-intensive sectors (parts of economies where women tended to be concentrated) such as textiles and export sectors, but also aimed at enhancing women's economic participation through higher value-added activities (UNCTAD 2014b). It is therefore important to work within sectors in which women predominate (i.e. SMEs, cross-border trading in some regions) to promote their leadership while taking care to **understand differences between women working in trade** and not to homogenise different women's experiences (Cornwall, Harrison and Whitehead 2008). While there is no agreement about how to do this across the board or in trade specifically, there are some examples of good practices (discussed below), many of which acknowledge the need for a twin-track approach of gender-specific programming and organisational mainstreaming, much like the ITC programme.

### **Participation in Trade Policy**

Ongoing issues include both the **capacity** of trade negotiators to understand gender issues as well as the women's rights organizations capacity to participate in negotiations (Williams 2013). Indeed, one of the key critiques feminists have levelled at the multilateral trading system has been the absence of women's voices in the determination of policy, and the lack of opportunities to participate in decision-making fora. Recent evidence at the national level in Laos found that a well-established system for women's representation and gender mainstreaming in government structures made for a successful and gender-sensitive export expansion strategy (World Bank 2012).

### **Good Practices Relevant to Trade**

Based on this evidence, the following represent some elements of strong policies, programs and organisational linkages needed to carry forward gender mainstreaming as part of a two-pronged approach of mainstreaming and targeted support:

---

<sup>20</sup> Indeed, there are several monitoring tools that have been developed including Social Impact Assessments (SIAs), Human Development Impact Assessment (HDIA) and the Gender Trade Impact Assessment (Women's Edge)

<sup>21</sup> "In the case of NAFTA, for example, - which includes numerous side agreements (the side agreement on North American Agreement on Labour Cooperation is the first case of workers' rights considerations, including the equality of women and men in employment and pay, being ever linked to a trade agreement in more than a passing manner) - it seems that no concrete improvements in the labour practices of the countries involved in the disputes have taken place as a result of the petitions, and the whole system has therefore proved rather ineffective (Nolan Garcia, 2010)" (UNCTAD 2014b).

- **Commitments to shift internal institutional cultures** so that gender equality is seen as integral (and not competitive with) wider development and trade objectives and as a normal and necessary part of staff capacity and program design.
- Trade policies and programmes are **strongly connected to wider development** and economic policies, commitments and spheres of work such (e.g. labour rights).
- Technical proposals linked not only with gender analytical information but with **participatory needs assessments** and ongoing mechanisms for engagement by participant-beneficiaries and women’s organizations.
- Innovative programming that works toward **transformation of gender inequalities at interconnected micro, meso and macro levels** (e.g. intra-household power relations, social gender norms, labour market segmentation etc.)
- **Rigorous, contextual and cautious approach to the evidence and research** around gender, trade and poverty that takes care to avoid reproducing ‘gender myths’ and homogenising different women and workers’ experiences.
- Streamlined consideration of how employment, income and formal economic participation affect **divisions of labour and especially women’s unpaid work**.

### ***The Big Picture: A Mixed Policy and Project Plan***

#### **Strengths of ITC Mainstreaming Policies**

- **A clear and well-written mainstreaming policy** identifying some key issues, areas of evidence and rationale for ITC intervention.
- **A strong statement of commitment** in relation to what is considered a difficult area for gender equality (trade), combined with reasonable lines of senior management accountability. This includes relatively well outlined lines of accountability and senior management involvement in the Project Plan. E.g. “Senior Management is responsible for the approval and implementation of an Action Plan to guide the realisation of the policy, supported by the mobilisation of adequate human and financial resources” (ITC Mainstreaming Policy page 11).
- **Strong institutional and niche fit.** ITC’s focus on women and trade is an excellent and appropriate niche area given the ITC focus on trade related technical assistance (TRTA) to small businesses. The areas of work around women in value chains, cross-border traders and female entrepreneurs represent a significant and well-communicated area of specialization.
- **A good focus on internal systems as well as external programming.** Internally this includes aims for “a gender-balanced work force”(ITC Mainstreaming Policy page 8) through gender parity in ITC staff and gender-sensitive workplaces. Internal organisational change has been a notoriously difficult area in gender mainstreaming and thus a highly welcome priority in the strategy (Objective 5).
- **Recognition of the need for consultation with women and women’s organisations** (pages, 4 and 10). The policy outlines how women’s organisations and women themselves are often marginalised from the consultation processes informing many trade agreements. Indeed this democratic deficit is an issue broadly, where many trade agreements are not subject to any democratic oversight or participatory process.
- **Specification of results through M&E systems** is helpful in both the Policy and Project Plan, especially in the focus on sex-disaggregated data (Objective 1, 4).

- **Prioritisation of staff capacity issues** and provisioning of training are well represented in the policies as key dimensions of gender mainstreaming in trade (Objective 2).

### Weaknesses of ITC Mainstreaming Policies

- **Missed opportunity<sup>22</sup> to emphasize the need to base policy on gender analysis of trade, economies and societies.** These will differ by context but the document could have been strengthened by making the case for the need to understand gender dimensions of economies and societies as part of any policy making process. In relation to trade, this is a key principle to understanding and assessing the possible implications of program, projects and policies that is taken up in other areas of ITC's work, but having this in the mainstreaming documents would represent a key principle going forward.
- **Narrow conceptualisation of gender as women and men,** which requires updating. Narrow conceptualisation of gender can have knock on effects by shaping policies in ways that can homogenise differences amongst groups, including on the basis of class, role or sector of work, caste, ethnicity/race, sexuality, ability and other spheres of difference.
- **An incomplete human rights case for gender equality in trade.** It is excellent to see the links being made with a number of global principles guiding both policies, especially the mention of the Convention on the Elimination of all Forms of Discrimination Against Women (CEDAW). However, the linkages with these human rights instruments within the main Policy are weak, though somewhat stronger in the Project Plan. In both, **there are still key gaps in connecting gender and trade to labour rights** and ILO's work, for example. While human rights are mentioned as part of the section on global guiding principles (ITC Mainstreaming Policy, page 6), these issues are not linked up with the 'development case' made for gender mainstreaming (ITC Mainstreaming Policy, page 4).
- A definition of mainstreaming without a strong internal institutional vision for the future.<sup>23</sup> The definition and approach of mainstreaming offered in the Policy is similar to those in other areas that focus on changing existing institutional processes and training current staff. However, greater emphasis on making gender analysis a key and routine area for all future staff capacity, programs and policies could strengthen the approach. Some key questions that could serve as indicators of how effective mainstreaming into existing projects has been could be: does gender align with pre-existing objectives and frameworks? To what extent can gender change/halt/interrupt programs?
- **Good use of evidence overall but a more cautious and nuanced exposition is warranted.** While there is a development case made for the focus on gender mainstreaming, there is a narrow conceptualisation of gender equality and some

---

(a) <sup>22</sup> This could have been integrated for example, in this section on Lessons Learned Since The Beijing Platform For Action (1995).

<sup>23</sup> The DFID PCR also replicates this narrow view: "Outcome: Understanding that in order to be considered gender mainstreamed, project managers have to *clearly articulate gender issues and how they have been addressed* throughout the document. This means that as an organisation, continuity in ensuring that project elements related to women's economic empowerment are *delivered as they were designed*; and that ITC is *able to influence implementing partners* to take into account the differential needs of men and women" (DFID PCR emphasis added). It is not clear that without quality criteria, these actions are sufficient to promote gender equality.

instrumentalisation of women in relation to both development and economic growth objectives. In some areas, attributing inevitability instead of correlation between factors highlights, the need for treating evidence with greater care. For example, causal linkages between women's economic participation behaviours and other wider benefits appear thin and require further testing.<sup>24</sup>

- **A strong push for results but not necessarily in ways that can capture change in relation to gender equality.** The ITC gender ITC Mainstreaming Policy seeks out a number of synergies with reporting and evaluation frameworks, and importantly emphasizes the need for accountability mechanisms in order for gender considerations to be effectively considered throughout the aid cycle. In the words of the ITC strategy, “what gets measured gets done” (ITC Gender Mainstreaming Strategy, page 11). However, it is important to note that what is measured is not always easily measurable, always quantifiable or straightforward, especially in the territory of women's rights (AWID 2010). In order to pursue difficult to measure yet nonetheless important work, sustained leadership and resources are imperative. Considering developing the strategic framework and performance indicators together with the clients/beneficiary groups (i.e. a participatory approach to policy development) could represent a **next step** for the ITC's gender and trade work.
- **Capacity building work could be taken to the next level by** promoting the normalisation of **gender as a key skill area**, and in addition to adequate and sustainable training, seeking out and hiring staff with this expertise. Increasing capacity could also involve including gender in personal performance evaluation frameworks as well ensuring these skills amongst consultants through TORs and procurement processes.
- **Developing clear processes for revision and consultation** in relation to participant-beneficiaries themselves is greatly needed in the next phase. The Policy states a goal to “incorporate women's input into consultations and project activities and implement projects in a gender-sensitive manner” but specific lines of accountability are absent in both policy and project plan. Indeed, the connections between processes for revision<sup>25</sup> and consultation in relation to the ITC Mainstreaming Policy, Project Plan and Action Plans are not fleshed out.

### ***Further Issues and Areas for Follow Up***

These are several areas in programming and institutional change for which clarity is needed, which may have been addressed in subsequent action plans but which are neglected in the founding documents and may represent emerging, specific areas of work.

### **Programming**

- The **connections between programming, leadership and resources** could be more tightly and clearly outlined in both the Policy and Project Plan. For example,

---

<sup>24</sup> For example, “women entrepreneurs are more likely to employ other women and purchase from women suppliers. This, in turn, could be said to lead to a virtuous engagement of women in the value chain” (ITC Mainstreaming Policy page 4)

<sup>25</sup> “While the strategic objectives and programming areas may be reprioritized over time; the gender ITC Mainstreaming Policy will remain in place” (ITC Mainstreaming Policy, Page 3).



the policy doesn't always highlight the role of leadership and resources in ensuring gender mainstreaming.<sup>26</sup>

- **Program Design must include quality indicators** in order to go beyond “articulation” (Mainstreaming Policy, page 10) of how men and women are targeted as beneficiaries to assess the meaningfulness and appropriateness of how gender is considered within program design.
- **More options linking with other complementary policies** and areas of work. For example, there is good support to businesswomen but it is not evident in the mainstreaming policies how this work links up with value chain upgrading work (e.g. Barrientos et al 2010, Barrientos 2014). It seems like some of these links have been happening somewhat in practice but it is difficult to know from documentation how the engagement with value chain work promotes upgrading for women, let alone links with more transformative changes.
- **Refining M&E** will benefit from explicit discussion of success criteria for influencing partners,<sup>27</sup> incorporation of qualitative indicators and discussion about further disaggregating data by age as well as other differences, which may represent the next iteration in development of sex-disaggregated data (Derbyshire et al 2015). Moreover, some of the existing performance indicators appear rather thin: for example, the DFID PCR an audit in 2010 found that 24 per cent of projects had mainstreamed gender compared to 43 per cent at the end of 2012. However, “most of this increase was due to existing projects reviewing their performance indicators to take account of their impact on women.” This is a welcome step, but does not meet a meaningful conceptualization of mainstreaming as an added step after project design.

## Institutional Issues

The focus on staff parity and gender-sensitive working practices is highly welcome, however, an update on progress achieved to date is need to better evaluate these given several areas mentioned in the policies such as:

- the effects of a **high level of volatility in staffing**, which can impact gender analysis capacity depending on how in house gender training takes place but may also represent opportunities to attract staff with strong gender backgrounds. More information is needed on how this volatility affects gender mainstreaming work both internally and externally.
- The culture of '**long working hours syndrome**'. ITC could innovate and ensure parental leave promotes contemporary recommendations on work-life policies in relation to diversity (Özbilgin et al 2011, Smithson, J., & Stokoe 2005), including promoting use of paternity leave and ensuring benefits include same sex couples.

---

<sup>26</sup> For example “To start, ITC’s commitment to mainstreaming needs to be embedded in the ITC strategic framework, and subsequently programme and project performance indicators to ensure that it happens. Gender mainstreaming throughout all ITC’s policies, processes and activities will help this stated priority to succeed” (ITC Mainstreaming Policy Page 5).

<sup>27</sup> “Disaggregation for gender means explicitly targeting both men and women, not using general terminology such as persons, clients groups, producer groups, the poor or even SMEs and entrepreneurs. ....It is even more important to specify and articulate women (and men) as beneficiaries, as ITC often implements through partners” (\_\_\_).

## Areas for Follow Up

- What has been the quality of ITC Gender ITC Mainstreaming Policy Action Plans?
- What are the results of the annual gender audit to track the gender balance in its projects?
- How is the quality of program documents assessed?
- How has high level leadership worked in relation to gender mainstreaming? And what are the connections between the women and trade area and the rest of ITCs work?
- What has been the experience of the Gender Working Group? Has it been effective?
- Is the budget sufficient for ongoing mainstreaming work? (There was the Initial tranche of 250,000). Where did this funding come from since not directly supported by DFID?
- Has the strategy for resource mobilization to support gender mainstreaming in initiatives been drafted/implemented?

## Conclusion

ITC have identified a significant and important niche area of support and delivered strongly on some areas. A 2013 DFID project completion review<sup>28</sup> remarked on some of the achievements of ITC's gender mainstreaming efforts, including: Gender policy and Action Plan approved by Senior Management Committee in April 2011; Gender specific objectives included in ITC's strategic indicators; Gender policy training materials developed and approved; Target of training 10 per cent of programme and project staff in 2011 exceeded (actual: 27 per cent); Gender audit module 'Development Marker' developed and included in gender training programme; Gender mainstreamed into Strategic Plan and Operational Plan.

However, it will be important to further assess how institutionalised these achievements have been and what changes have been in institutional culture. Indeed, ways of measuring this institutionalisation are incomplete without qualitative assessment of the meaningfulness of the inclusion of gender into projects, programs and policies and how these are linked, resourced and led. Moreover, key questions remain about the extent to which this meaningful inclusion of gender in programming and institutional culture can help transform gender inequalities and the lives of women and girls in the different contexts of ITC's work.

---

<sup>28</sup> DFID, Project Completion Review (PCR) "Project Title: Support to International Trade Centre (ITC) Aries Project Number – 201092."

## Annex Twelve: Benchmarking case study

The benchmarking of project level costs has been done on the basis of assessing stated output level results as stated in the PCR divided by the budget allocation figures provided to the evaluation team. The evaluation team does not have disaggregated budgets per output, so an equal weighting has been given to the value of each indicator.

<b>Output: Women and Trade communications and training influences programmes and policy at the national and international levels (approx \$1.4m)</b>			
<b>Indicator</b>	<b>Results</b>	<b>Budget</b>	<b>Unit cost</b>
Number of high profile events held on trade and gender	16	\$350k	\$21,875 / event
Number of senior government representatives that commit to exploring changes to government procurement policies and practices through participating in targeted events and meetings.	60	\$350k	\$5,833 / senior government rep
Number of trade development programme documents Diagnostic Trade Integration Study (DTISs) Enhanced Integrated Framework (EIF) Tier II projects, National Export Strategies (NES) gender mainstreamed through training and technical assistance	16 x DTIS 8 x EIF Tier 2 9 x NES or sectoral strategies	\$120k \$115k \$115k	\$7,500/ DTIS \$14,375/ project \$12,778/ NES
Number of resolutions, declarations and other intergovernmental agreements strengthened to include references to gender equality or women's participation in trade.	8	\$350k	\$43,750/ agreement
<b>Output: Capacity of trade support institutions strengthened to support business women (approx \$3.2m)</b>			
Number of functioning women's associations developed in selected sectors	10	\$1.07m	\$107,000/ association
Number of business women reporting improved skills related to their selected export sector	1,198	\$1.07m	\$893/ business woman
Number of national, regional and international TSIs building the capacity of business women	81	\$1.07m	\$1,320/ TSI
<b>Output: The international competitiveness of women's enterprises strengthened through training and support (approx \$0.7m*)</b>			
Number of buyers and/ or development partners committed to sourcing from women vendors, including through the Chongqing Platform for Action	386	\$233k	\$604/ buyers/vendor
Number of WBEs having met potential buyers and, as a result, transacted business	160	\$233k	\$1,456/ transacted WBEs
Value of business transacted between WBEs as a result of 5.2 above	\$20.8m	\$233k	Multiplier of 89
<b>Output: Gender mainstreamed into ITC's policies, processes and activities through development of ITC's Gender Policy (approx \$1.6m)</b>			
Development and implementation of gender policy	n/a	\$400k	n/a
Gender mainstreamed into ITC project quality and	n/a	\$400k	n/a

evaluation systems			
Percentage of ITC projects reviewed through the annual gender audit scoring progressively higher levels of gender mainstreaming	n/a	\$400k	n/a
Institutional adoption of gender policy through human resources practices	n/a	\$400k	n/a

\*Note: Value based on total budget figure as per ToR minus budget allocation in logframe using GBP/USD = 1.55.

## References

African Development Bank Group (2013) "Gender Equality Results of Public Sector Projects and Programmes of The African Development Bank 2009- 2011"

Available at <http://www.focusintl.com/GD189-per-cent20Gender-per-cent20equality-per-cent20results-per-cent20of-per-cent20public-per-cent20sector-per-cent20projects-per-cent20and-per-cent20programmes-per-cent20of-per-cent20the-per-cent20African-per-cent20Development-per-cent20Bank-per-cent20per-cent202009-2011-per-cent29.pdf>

AWID (2010), Capturing Change in Women's Realities, A Critical Overview of Current Monitoring & Evaluation Frameworks and Approaches, <http://www.awid.org/About-AWID/AWID-News/Capturing-Change-in-Women-s-Realities>

Barrientos, S., Gereffi, G., & Nathan, D. (2010). Capturing the Gains. Gender Dimensions of Cocoa-chocolate Value Chains. University of Manchester. Presentation at SDC e+ i net.

Barrientos, S. (2014). Gendered Global Production Networks: Analysis of Cocoa-Chocolate Sourcing. *Regional Studies*, (ahead-of-print), 1-13.

Benshop, Yvonne and Mieke Verloo (2006), 'Sisyphus' Sisters: Can Gender Mainstreaming Escape the Genderedness of Organizations?', *Journal of Gender Studies*, 15(1), pp. 19 — 33.

Brouwers, Ria 2013 'Revisiting gender mainstreaming in international development: Goodbye to an illusionary strategy' Working Paper No. 556, Institute of Social Studies, Netherlands.

Cornwall, Andrea, E. Harrison and A. Whitehead (2008) *Gender Myths and Feminist Fables: The Struggle for Interpretive Power in Gender and Development*, Wiley Blackwell.

Derbyshire, Helen, Nadja Dolata and Kanwal Ahluwalia (2015) "Untangling Gender Mainstreaming: A Theory of Change based on experience and reflection" *Gender and Development Network (GADN) Briefings*.

Eerdewijk, A. (2014) The micropolitics of evaporation: gender mainstreaming instruments in practice., *Journal of International Development*, 26, pp. 345-355.

EIGE "Good Practices in Gender Mainstreaming: Towards Effective Gender Training Mainstreaming Gender into the Policies and the Programmes of the Institutions of European Union and EU Member States" [http://eige.europa.eu/sites/default/files/Good-Practices-in-Gender-Mainstreaming-towards-effective-gender-training\\_0.pdf](http://eige.europa.eu/sites/default/files/Good-Practices-in-Gender-Mainstreaming-towards-effective-gender-training_0.pdf)

Eyben, Rosalind (2013) 'Uncovering the Politics of 'Evidence' and 'Results'. A Framing Paper for Development Practitioners, paper prepared for Conference on Big Push Forward, April. Available online <http://bigpushforward.net/wp-content/uploads/2011/01/The-politics-of-evidence-11-April-20133.pdf>.

Evers, B. (1999) "Engendering the trade policy review mechanism of the WTO." In *Gender Focus on the WTO*, ed. Haxton, E. Olsson, C, 91-99. Sweden: Global Publications Foundation.

Fontana, M. (2013). *GENDER IN ECONOMY-WIDE MODELLING*. *New Frontiers in Feminist Political Economy*, 154.

Goetz, Anne-Marie (1997) *Getting Institutions Right for Women in Development*, New York, Zed Books.

Grown, C., Bahadur, C., Handbury, J., & Elson, D. (2006). *The financial requirements of achieving gender equality and women's empowerment*.

- Harcourt, Wendy (2009) "Literature Review on Gender and Fragility." European Report on Development, Brussels: European Commission. Available at <http://www.gsdrc.org/go/display&type=Document&id=4309>
- Moser, C. and A. Moser (2005), 'Gender mainstreaming since Beijing: a review of success and limitations in international institutions', *Gender and Development*, 13, pp.11-22.
- Özbilgin, M. F., Beauregard, T. A., Tatli, A., & Bell, M. P. (2011). Work–life, diversity and intersectionality: a critical review and research agenda. *International Journal of Management Reviews*, 13(2), 177-198.
- Prügl, Elisabeth and A. Lustgarten (2006) 'Mainstreaming Gender in International Organizations', in J.S. Jaquette & G. Summerfield (Eds.) *Women and gender equity in development theory and practice: institutions, resources, and mobilization*, Duke University Press.
- Meier, Petra and Karen Celis (2011) 'Sowing the Seeds of Its Own Failure: Implementing the Concept of Gender Mainstreaming', *Social Politics* 2011 18 (4), pp. 469–489.
- Mukhopadhyay, Maitrayee 2006 'Mainstreaming Gender or Streaming Gender Away? Feminists Marooned in the Development Business', in Andrea Cornwall, Elizabeth Harrison, Ann Whitehead (eds) in *Feminisms in Development: Contradictions, Contestations and Challenges*, London, Zed Books.
- Mukhopadhyay, Maitrayee (2013) 'Mainstreaming Gender or Reconstituting the Mainstream? Gender Knowledge in Development', *Journal of International Development* 26(3), pp. 356–367.
- Rao, [Aruna](#), [Rieky Stuart](#), [David Kelleher](#) 1999 *Gender at work: organizational change for equality*, London, Kumarian Press.
- Sandler, J. (2005) 'Gender Mainstreaming in the Age of Aid Effectiveness', Presentation by Joanne Sandler, UNIFEM to the OECD-DAC Network on Gender Equality, Paris.
- Smithson, J., & Stokoe, E. H. (2005). Discourses of work–life balance: negotiating 'genderblind' terms in organizations. *Gender, Work & Organization*, 12(2), 147-168.
- UNCTAD (2014), "Virtual Institute Teaching Material On Trade And Gender, Volume 1: Unfolding The Links"  
[http://unctad.org/en/PublicationsLibrary/gds2014d1\\_en.pdf](http://unctad.org/en/PublicationsLibrary/gds2014d1_en.pdf)
- UNCTAD (2014b), "Virtual Institute Teaching Material On Trade And Gender, Volume, Volume 2 Empirical Analysis of the Trade and Gender Links"  
[http://unctad.org/en/PublicationsLibrary/gds2014d2\\_en.pdf](http://unctad.org/en/PublicationsLibrary/gds2014d2_en.pdf)
- UNCTAD (2008) *Mainstreaming Gender into Trade and Development Strategies in Africa*, United Nations, New York.  
[http://unctad.org/en/Docs/ditctncd200713\\_en.pdf](http://unctad.org/en/Docs/ditctncd200713_en.pdf)
- UNCTAD, (2009) "Mainstreaming Gender in Trade – Note by UNCTAD Secretariat"  
[http://unctad.org/en/Docs/ciem2d2\\_en.pdf](http://unctad.org/en/Docs/ciem2d2_en.pdf)
- van der Vleuten, A., Van Eerdewijk, A., & Roggeband, C. (Eds.). (2014). *Gender Equality Norms in Regional Governance: Transnational Dynamics in Europe, South America and Southern Africa*. Palgrave Macmillan.
- Watkins, Francis (2004) 'DFID's Experience of Gender Mainstreaming: 1995 to 2004', Department for International Development.
- Williams, M. (2013). A Perspective on Feminist in International Organizing from the Bottom up: the Case of IGTN and the WTO. *Feminist Strategies in International Governance*, 97-98.

Wong, Franz. 2013 Following the commitment: development NGOs and gender mainstreaming – the case of Oxfam GB. Doctoral thesis, University of Sussex.

World Bank (2012), Lao PDR - Mapping the Gender Dimensions of Trade : A Preliminary Exposition. [http://www-wds.worldbank.org/external/default/WDSContentServer/WDSP/IB/2012/08/30/000333038\\_20120830001102/Rendered/PDF/708080REVISED0000Trade0Report0FINAL.pdf](http://www-wds.worldbank.org/external/default/WDSContentServer/WDSP/IB/2012/08/30/000333038_20120830001102/Rendered/PDF/708080REVISED0000Trade0Report0FINAL.pdf)

#### Further Reading

20 years of gender mainstreaming – how can we do it better?

<http://gadnetwork.org/blogs/2015/3/6/20-years-of-gender-mainstreaming-how-can-we-do-it-better>

Mainstreaming Gender in Global Public Policy

<http://www.tandfonline.com/doi/pdf/10.1080/1461674032000122740>

Mainstreaming Gender in Governance

<http://genderandsecurity.org/projects-resources/research/mainstreaming-gender-global-governance>

Gender Mainstreaming: Productive Tensions in Theory and Practice

<http://sp.oxfordjournals.org/content/12/3/321.extract>

<http://gadnetwork.org/blogs/2015/3/6/20-years-of-gender-mainstreaming-how-can-we-do-it-better> and the brief:

<http://static1.squarespace.com/static/536c4ee8e4b0b60bc6ca7c74/t/54fdd6dce4b074390df319a5/1425921756041/GADN+GM+Briefing+FINAL.pdf>

<https://www.opendemocracy.net/5050/heather-mcrobie/gender-mainstreaming-future-of-feminism-or-feminism> per centE2 per cent80 per cent99s-disappearing-act

<http://www.unesco.org/new/fileadmin/MULTIMEDIA/HQ/SHS/pdf/Gender-Mainstreaming.pdf>

<https://www.icrw.org/files/publications/Gender-Mainstreaming-Making-It-Happen.pdf>

UN Women/UN publications

[http://www.unwomen.org/~media/headquarters/attachments/sections/how\\_per\\_cent20we\\_per\\_cent20work/unsystemcoordination/final\\_per\\_cent20egm\\_per\\_cent20report\\_per\\_cent201\\_per\\_cent20nov\\_per\\_cent20version\\_per\\_cent20pdf.pdf](http://www.unwomen.org/~media/headquarters/attachments/sections/how_per_cent20we_per_cent20work/unsystemcoordination/final_per_cent20egm_per_cent20report_per_cent201_per_cent20nov_per_cent20version_per_cent20pdf.pdf)

Practical Guide for Programming

<http://static1.squarespace.com/static/536c4ee8e4b0b60bc6ca7c74/t/53c5416ae4b0cb5e94fcd8a5/1405436266672/Gender+Mainstreaming+resource+PACK+final+May+2010.pdf>

Women's Rights/Feminist developed

<http://wwda.org.au/wp-content/uploads/2013/12/genmainstream1.pdf>

Evaluations

[http://www.genderaction.org/images/Evaluation\\_per\\_cent20PRSP-Gender\\_per\\_cent20Oxfam.pdf](http://www.genderaction.org/images/Evaluation_per_cent20PRSP-Gender_per_cent20Oxfam.pdf)

Mainstreaming in thematic area (global governance)

<http://genderandsecurity.org/projects-resources/research/mainstreaming-gender-global-governance>

Gender Mainstreaming in the Multilateral Trading System– A handbook for policymakers and other stakeholders

<https://books.google.com/books?id=hJ9t-EoGql0C&pg=PA187&lpq=PA187&dq=barbara+evers+trade+and+gender&source=bl&ots=K>

[rRzDQce-W&sig=zDMHmTRWle7Px7mov6RVoo\\_iKyM&hl=en&sa=X&ei=g7EEVZm-E-bjsAS4p4J4&ved=0CDQQ6AEwBQ#v=onepage&q=barbara per cent20evers per cent20trade per cent20and per cent20gender&f=false](http://www.jstor.org/stable/230725758932?sid=21106115868363&uid=3739256&uid=2129&uid=3739832&uid=70&uid=2&uid=4)

Trading Stories – Experiences with Trade and Gender

<https://books.thecommonwealth.org/trading-stories-paperback>

And - a review of Trading Stories by Mariama Williams and Marilyn Carr

<http://www.jstor.org/discover/10.2307/25758932?sid=21106115868363&uid=3739256&uid=2129&uid=3739832&uid=70&uid=2&uid=4>

M. Williams – The interface of research on gender and trade with the negotiations of trade agreements and trade policy making

[http://www.generoycomercio.org/areas/investigacion/M\\_Williams.pdf](http://www.generoycomercio.org/areas/investigacion/M_Williams.pdf)

Coche I, Kotschwar B and Salazar–Xirinachs JM (2006). Gender Issues in Trade

Policymaking . OAS Trade Series.

[http://www.sice.oas.org/genderandtrade/genderissuesintp\\_e.asp](http://www.sice.oas.org/genderandtrade/genderissuesintp_e.asp)

Nilufer Cagaty - Gender Inequalities and International Trade – A Theoretical Reconsideration

[http://www.ciedur.org.uy/adm/archivos/publicacion\\_101.pdf](http://www.ciedur.org.uy/adm/archivos/publicacion_101.pdf)

Trade and Gender – Cutting Edge Pack

<http://www.bridge.ids.ac.uk/bridge-publications/cutting-edge-packs/gender-and-trade>

CIDA - Gender Equality and Trade Related Capacity Building – A Resource Tool for Practitioners

[http://www.acdi-cida.gc.ca/INET/IMAGES.NSF/vLUIImages/Policy/\\$file/Trade-Related per cent20Capacity per cent20Building.pdf](http://www.acdi-cida.gc.ca/INET/IMAGES.NSF/vLUIImages/Policy/$file/Trade-Related per cent20Capacity per cent20Building.pdf)

Gender Equality and Trade Policy

Women Watch

<http://www.un.org/womenwatch/feature/trade/Gender-Perspectives-in-Trade-Policy.html>

Vargas-Hill R and Vigneri M (2011). Mainstreaming gender sensitivity in cash crop market supply chains. ESA Working Paper No. 11-08. United Nations Food and Agriculture Organization, Rome.