

This project is funded by the European Union





# **GRASP** • **PAKISTAN**

# GROWTH FOR RURAL ADVANCEMENT AND SUSTAINABLE PROGRESS

Policy Brief on Rural SME Competitiveness and Sustainability Strategy for Sindh

www.intracen.org/GRASP/

The designations employed and the presentation of material in this document do not imply the expression of any opinion whatsoever on the part of the International Trade Centre concerning the legal status of any country, territory, city or area or of its authorities, or concerning the delimitation of its frontiers or boundaries. **GRASP • PAKISTAN** 

# GROWTH FOR RURAL ADVANCEMENTAND SUSTAINABLE PROGRESS



## Policy brief on Rural SME Competitiveness and Sustainability Strategy for

### Balochistan

#### 1. Introduction

Agricultural SMEs are central to Pakistan's economy. About 68% of Pakistan's population is directly or indirectly engaged with agriculture, which contributes 21% to the country's GDP, where livestock and horticulture account for 70% of national value-added agriculture. In Balochistan, agriculture accounts for 54% of the province's GDP with livestock rearing contributing about 40%<sup>1</sup>. Agriculture sector also provides employment to about 65% of the labour force.

Given the sector's role in gender inclusive employment, food security and macro economy, improving the competitiveness of agricultural and rural SMEs can help Pakistan achieve Agenda 2030 and Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs) on poverty, hunger, gender, decent work and climate. Rural development, therefore, needs targeted support to public and private sectors, enabling rural SMEs and agribusinesses to become more competitive by making improvements at all levels of value chain, and ensuring conducive institutional and regulatory environment.<sup>2</sup>

#### 2. Situation Analysis

Policy architecture for agriculture sub-sectors in Balochistan needs improvements, and in cases where adequate understanding exists, detailed strategies and action plans are needed for its effective implementation. Weak farming practices, high post-harvest losses and outdated technology are some of the cross-cutting characteristics that mark Balochistan's rural economy leading to low farm productivity and limited value addition at the SME level amid a weak business environment and institutional framework.

In addition, the policy formulation process is fragmented and would benefit from adoption of whole-ofgovernment-approach. The sectoral and cross-sectoral policies as well as the federal and provincial regulations and policies are often not synchronized which should otherwise complement and supplement each other for enhancing enterprise competitiveness<sup>3</sup>.

The policies that have been developed would have benefited immensely from detailed researched inputs to address the technological, economic, commercial and cultural needs of the firms. The process of

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> International Trade Centre, May 2020, Competitiveness of Rural SMEs and their resilience to Covid-19 crisis: Evidence from Balochistan, Pakistan. Hereafter: ITC 2020

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> Rural SMEs are construed to be small scale farmers, input suppliers, or small processors where small and medium horticulture and livestock units are defined as: horticulture – small, up to 16 acres & medium, above 16 acres to 64 acres; livestock cattle – small, 1 – 5 animals & medium, 6 – 25 animals; and livestock goats – small, less than 30 animals & medium, 30 – 100 animals.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> Food and Agriculture Organization, Feb 2020, Review of Agricultural Policies, Sindh and Balochistan. (internal study)

dialogue and consultation with the stakeholders has significant room for improvement to become inclusive and systematic. On the flipside, despite their large number, SMEs in general and rural SMEs in particular do not have a voice in policy formulation or implementation to ensure that rules and regulations accommodate their specific needs. The academics in Balochistan conducting research on these subjects are somehow also not part of the wider policy debates at the provincial government level.

Farmers are known to have weak bargaining power due to lack of cooperative organization, declining farm size, distance from market, lack of competition between buyers, reliance on buyers for credit. As a consequence, farmers' revenue is low relative to the market price of their produce, even though there isn't significant value addition across the farm to market value chain. Research indicates that about 85% of farmers in Pakistan do not have basic formal education, and 90% do not have middle level education; considering that Balochistan has highest rates of multidimensional poverty in the country, its farmers' capacity to understand information provided on good agricultural practices is the weakest.<sup>4</sup>

With the exception of few, most business support organizations in Balochistan's public and private sector are unable to effectively engage with constituents, conduct needs assessment; lack knowledge and skills to plan, implement, and monitor cascaded key performance indicators; lack robust standardized systems and processes for collecting, recording, assessing and reporting results; and do not have in place knowledge management processes and disciplines while client management systems are often rudimentary<sup>5</sup>.

From the perspective of livestock and horticulture, a few observations stand out: production practices are basic resulting in low yields; production units are small leading to low economies of scale; quality of inputs is poor and farmers are not abreast with best practices both to produce high volumes and to be environmentally sustainable; value chain is weakly developed with low value addition by intermediaries; insufficient interaction with non-farm agribusinesses; and reliance on informal sources of credit or personal savings rather than formal credit which makes them vulnerable to economic shocks.<sup>6</sup>

Amid these challenges, Government of Balochistan has shown resolve to move forward and aims to support supply chain activities like grading, packaging, seedling and production, by the enhanced development of rural farmer marketing collectives and mutual marketing organisations.<sup>7</sup> Small and Medium Enterprises Development Authority (SMEDA) will also establish an agro-food processing facility to minimize post-harvest losses in horticulture produce.<sup>8</sup>

#### Backdrop to Covid-19

Assessing the direct impact of Covid-19 on Balochistan's rural economy is impaired by the fact that Pakistan does not officially produce sub-national GDP estimates. The problem is amplified because various official surveys and census, such as Census of Economic Establishments, Agricultural Machinery census;

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>4</sup> Ahmed & Asif 2016, National Study on Agriculture Investment in Pakistan. Working Paper # 157, Sustainable Development Policy Institute.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>5</sup> International Trade Centre, undated, Cubed Institutional Assessment of Business Support Organization: Balochistan and Sindh provinces of Pakistan.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>6</sup> Support to horticulture and livestock will not be complete without also ensuring basic inputs and public goods necessary for rural SMEs. Therefore, a focus on water resource development, electricity, irrigation, unprotected knowledge and know-how becomes important.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>7</sup> "Balochistan crop yield up 25pc under Australian aid." DAWN. December 22, 2020.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>8</sup> "SMEDA plans agro-processing facility to promote export of fruits." The News. November 24, 2020.

Livestock Census; Mouza/Village Census and Agriculture Census, have not been updated for at least a decade; fifteen years in some cases.

Balochistan Government does not have integrated formal process for damage and need assessment. Accordingly, no sector-wise damage and need assessment was conducted during Covid-19, nor were estimates of the impact of Covid-19 on Balochistan's GDP, unemployment, or poverty calculated officially. However, the province's Planning and Development (P&D) department feared significant post-harvest losses of fruits<sup>9</sup>, and a fall in prices received by farmers in case of continuous lockdown between May-August. Independent studies estimated that 90% of those in agriculture were vulnerable to being laid off during the lockdown.

#### 3. Methodology

To analyze the competitiveness of SMEs in Balochistan, this policy brief relies on ITC's SME competitiveness grid which focusses on the firms' capacity to compete by meeting current market requirements; to connect to buyers, suppliers, and institutions to obtain information and knowledge; to respond to market forces by investment in human or financial capital; to ensure long term competitiveness through gender inclusiveness and environment sustainability. These capacities have been assessed both at firm level and at the level of business ecosystem and regulatory environment, summary findings of which are in the next section.

To this end, in December 2019, the ITC collaborated with the University of Balochistan to survey agribusinesses and farmers in 7 districts. A follow-up phone-based survey concerning Covid-19 was carried out in May 2020, which (in September 2020) was followed by rapid review of regulatory and institutional response by Balochistan government to Covid-19. ITC in collaboration with a local policy think tank – Sustainable Development Policy Institute (SDPI) also engaged with the Government of Balochistan, business associations and representatives from rural businesses during a structured public-private dialogue to arrive at a better understanding of challenges amid Covid-19.<sup>10</sup>

This policy brief is the first step in the process of developing a Rural SME Competitiveness and Sustainable Strategy in Balochistan.

#### 4. Findings

#### State of competitiveness in agri-food markets<sup>11</sup>

Balochistan is beset by a host of problems that point to the need for investments in improved farm inputs as well as effective transportation and packaging of agricultural produce. For instance, 41% of livestock farmers surveyed depend mainly on low-cost feeding practices, while 15% rely on direct feeding. Scarcity of key inputs has an adverse effect on quality: half of interviewed farmers pointed to the unavailability of vaccines, medicines and quality inputs as the biggest challenge. As a result of poor access to storage facilities and weak transportation infrastructure for timely delivery given underdeveloped 'last-mile' connectivity, 71% of interviewed farmers said they do not store any produce, and a similar number said that their post-harvest losses were up to 10%. Only 25% of interviewed farmers had received advice from

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>9</sup> Planning and Development Dept, Government of Balochistan (2020). "COVID-19: Balochistan Socio-economic Impact Assessment and Response Plan", unpublished and yet unapproved version

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>10</sup> "SMEs critical for Pakistan's growth during present times". The Express Tribune, September 10, 2020.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>11</sup> This section summarizes key findings from ITC 2020.

agricultural extension in the preceding year, while 63% of reported having no access to veterinary advice for animal medicines.

#### Connecting small farms with value chain

Balochistan's rugged terrain and long distances strain the linkages between value chain. But that's not the only reason why farmers earn abnormally low profits relative to other actors in the value chain; there is also significant information asymmetry. Only 25% of surveyed farmers said they use mobile phone to gather information on markets or pricing; most information comes from neighbours and traders. Only 41% surveyed farmers reported receiving good quality inputs, and only 20% said they always received their inputs on time. Around 47% of farmers belonged to a farmer association, of which 32% said no service was provided by the associations. Similarly, while about 75% farmers had accessed a public institution service, 43% of them rated them poorly.

#### Enhancing competitiveness of rural SMEs

Balochistan's farmers are constrained by weak skills, limited processing facilities and difficulties in meeting market requirements. Farmers shy from formal bank credit, relying instead on their own savings or informal moneylenders, which adds to their vulnerability. About 52% of surveyed farmers said their workers had sufficient skills, which given overall weak state of education and training in the province seems to be an overestimate perhaps due to lack of awareness of what it takes to be a skilled worker.

The absence of a proper grading system for livestock products means that farm-level investments in upgrading animal feeding and health do not always translate into better farm gate prices. Meat and dairy processing in the province are largely informal leading to low-margin products. Only 33% of the surveyed farmers said they had implemented some form of new technique or technology to improve production, while only 25% farmers, had switched to better seed varieties.

#### Social & environmental challenges to Balochistan's rural economy

The current rural economy ecosystem constrains the opportunities available to women. Women account only for 9% of total labour force, and are often excluded from decision making, education and marketing activities. Women in Balochistan are responsible for weeding, seed cleaning, drying, and storage of crops, mostly working on the land owned by men who usually control farm management decisions. Only 26% of surveyed farms were led by a woman, where women inclusion down the value chain is rarer.

In terms of sustainability, proliferation of deep-dug tube wells has lowered the water table, while inefficient water storage practices waste the rainwater, negatively affecting agricultural productivity over the long run. About 51% interviewed farmers said they had lost produce to drought, while 53% had lost produce to excessive rains. Some farmers are using technologies to address environmental challenges; 21% reported using mobile phones to access weather forecasting services. Most also use flood irrigation and other unsustainable irrigation methods, which underscores the need to rehabilitate traditional water management methods and adopt climate smart irrigation technologies.

#### Post-pandemic recovery

In Balochistan, 90% of those employed in the agriculture sector are estimated as vulnerable to being laid off during the shutdowns as lockdown-induced market closures led to fall in income and business closures. Nearly all of the agribusinesses (92%) and farms (92%) interviewed in May 2020 said their business operations had been affected by the pandemic, with 75% reporting as being moderately to strongly

affected. These businesses fear the worst as they anticipate the future waves of the pandemic. However, there is a clear intent to start focusing on the post-pandemic recovery and farm sector needs.

In terms of finances and working capital needs, the majority coped with the situation by using up their own savings or borrowing from informal sources, since neither do farmers prefer loans nor is bank credit available at a large scale – an area which needs careful attention as Pakistan implements the National Financial Inclusion Strategy. Outside of Ehsaas Emergency Cash Fund, most other relief measures announced by federal government were not applicable to livestock and horticulture farmers, in Balochistan, whereas those that were applicable to agri-businesses could not be availed due to low awareness. About 70% of the respondents said it was difficult to access information on business facilitation by government and central bank amid Covid-19.<sup>12</sup>

#### 5. Policy recommendations

The competitiveness of private enterprises in Balochistan will heavily depend upon improvements to national-level business climate. In this regard, national initiatives including those by the central bank, federal-government's support through SMEDA or planned national-level SME policy will play a critical role in growth and sustainability of firms in Balochistan. Federal initiatives to spur growth of startups including Kamyab Jawan program and micro finance schemes could also play a role in this direction as well. The timely implementation of the promised PKR 600 billion federally-funded uplift program for Southern Balochistan will help connect the livestock markets of the province with major markets of the country through tele-education; modernize the agro-markets and increase capacities of those involved; improve water and electricity infrastructure; and develop e-commerce ecosystem in the province.

Balochistan already has a comprehensive and sufficiently forward-looking Livestock Policy and Strategy 2020-2030. BLPS 2020-2030 is oriented towards inter alia strengthening of markets, investment promotion, as well as introduction of new technologies and marketing innovation across the value chain to address growth, poverty and climate change.

In light of our survey, pandemic-related challenges, and needs of rural SMEs highlighted above, following are some of the key recommendations Balochistan government may consider. In our view, regulatory institutions, private sector associations, research bodies, civil society organizations, and development partners will have to join hands to support Government of Balochistan in the implementation of this proposed portfolio of interventions. While a provincial rural SMEs policy is need of the hour a sector-specific support package for horticulture is also much required.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>12</sup> Lack of rapid assessment of credit worthiness and credibility of collateral is also known to be a concern by both potential borrowers and formal lenders.

No.	Need for change	Proposed action	Responsibility	Ongoing initiatives	
	General interventions proposed for both livestock & horticulture sectors				
1.	Addressing the gaps in regulatory ecosystem for both sectors	Undertake legislative work on updating and modernizing acts, rules & regulations. Harmonization of policy actions required across complimentary sub-sectors, including measures and procedures for land-use, sustainable management of farmlands. The latter necessitates policy measures for sustainable & efficient water management, administration and conservation, including procedures on water rights, uses & diversions, pricing & subsidy; Expedite approval of (draft) agriculture policy; Work with relevant institutions towards formulation of rural SMEs strategy for the province.	Agriculture and Cooperatives department (dept.) Livestock & Dairy Development dept. Irrigation dept. P&D dept. for support; Draft Agriculture Policy exists; GRASP can provide further technical support in its approval and also in development of rural SME strategy and its implementation.	GRASP is supporting review/update of following acts: Cooperative Societies Act, 1925; Seed Act; Essential Commodities Act; Agriculture Resource Conservation Act; Balochistan Agricultural Produce Markets Act, 1991; Agricultural Pesticides Ordinance, 1971 Act.	
2.	Develop and use public private	Expedite work on regulatory improvements under existing livestock policy and prepare a medium-term actionable plan for horticulture sector, executed by delivery units within line departments. Support from federal government may also be available as Strategic Trade Policy Framework (STPF) aims at approaching new export markets for horticulture. Develop vanilla PPP structures for	Line departments of livestock and agriculture. Planning & Development dept. (Pⅅ) for support.	GRASP has been requested by LDDD for support for Livestock Policy 2020-2030 implementation strategy and for developing sector plan.	
	partnerships (PPP) for the provision of public goods	provision of public goods aimed at increasing competitiveness of	livestock and agriculture, Pⅅ,		

No.	Need for change	Proposed action	Responsibility	Ongoing initiatives
		horticulture and livestock. These may	Balochistan Board of	
		include: PPP for various certifications	Investment & Trade.	
		and standards such as grading and food	PPP Units at	
		safety risks (e.g. foot and mouth disease	agriculture	
		certification for livestock); logistics and	department and Pⅅ	
		market infrastructure; provision of	can support.	
		electricity including from bio-gas and		
		solar power solutions for farms and agri-		
		businesses; and provision of minimum		
		internet infrastructure.		
		In line with BLPS 2020-2030 draft vanilla		
		PPP structures to deliver ICT and other		
		smart solutions-based extension		
		services. In this regard PPP Unit has been		
		established in Pⅅ and select line		
		departments who may take forward this		
		proposal.		
3.	Improve farmers' bargaining power	Strengthen farmer groups leading	Line departments of	
		towards strong associations that help	livestock and	
		bargaining relationships between agri-	agriculture. Local	
		businesses, middlemen and other	Government, Rural	
		stakeholders, and also provide critical	Development dept.	
		input toward policymaking and its	with support from	
		administration.	Agribusiness Support	
			Fund	
4.	Strengthen farmers' skill towards	Roll out <i>train-the-trainers</i> outreach	Line departments of	GRASP AMIS can also
	competitiveness, strengthening of	programmes on basic reading writing,	livestock and	be expanded for
	value chain, and sustainability	counting, accounting, quality inputs,	agriculture;	provision of mobile
		marketing, branding, niche markets,	environment, sports	based/e-learning
		packaging, storage, primary processing,	and youth affairs dept.	mode; short videos in
		market mapping, logistics, smart phone		local language on the
		usage, etc. with sustainability integral to		mentioned skills can be
		all process. Training may be executed in		

No.	Need for change	Proposed action	Responsibility	Ongoing initiatives
		support with organizations on the		developed and used for
		ground and district commissioners.		the purpose.
		Create smartphone-based training	Relevant line	GRASP MIS will also
		ecosystem in Urdu, Balochi, Pashto, and	departments; National	contain learning videos
		Brohi languages to train livestock and	Information	on 'Good Agricultural
		horticulture farmers on various aspects	Technology Board	Practice' on its website
		indicatively enlisted above. In districts	(NITB), National	and mobile app
		where internet penetration is a	Incubation Center at	
		constraint this training facility may be	Balochistan University	
		provided through mobile teams.	of Information	
			Technology,	
			Engineering and	
			Management Sciences	
			(BUITEMS)	
5.	Improve gender equality	Undertake legislation for living wage for	Line departments of	
		female farm workers, with special quota	livestock and	
		for women in formally registered farm	agriculture; women	
		enterprises	development dept.;	
			Labour dept.	
		Include women in agriculture extension	Line departments of	
		services. Selection of female farmers for	livestock and	
		subsidies and training may be proposed.	agriculture; Finance	
			dept.; Local	
			Government & Rural	
			dept.; women	
			development dept.	
6.	Access to finance to farmers	The central bank in collaboration with	State Bank of Pakistan	
		Pakistan Banks' Association may expand	(SBP); Pakistan Banks'	
		the availability and ceiling of collateral-	Association; Zarai	
		free finance; greater outreach required	Taraqiati Bank Limited;	
		for giving confidence to potential	micro finance	
		borrowers for approaching banks;	institutions; rural	
		encouraging fintech sector to provide	support programmes;	

No.	Need for change	Proposed action	Responsibility	Ongoing initiatives
		innovative solutions in regions where	line departments; and	
		banking network is weak. Combining	national incubation	
		technology with nano loans to speed up	center Quetta for	
		the lending process.	fintech solutions.	
			Fintechs that	
			specialize in nano	
			loans e.g. Tez Financial	
			Services could offer	
			advice	
7.	Effective utilization of government	Design criteria, rules & implementation	Line departments of	
	resources	framework for transparent, targeted	livestock and	
		subsidies for inputs such as seeds,	agriculture; Finance	
		fertilizer, and animal nutrition	dept.	
		Horticulture Sector		
8.	A formal policy or guiding document is	Balochistan government needs to	Agriculture and	
	needed to offer vision and drive	formulate horticulture sector policy	Cooperatives dept.	
	medium to long term growth in the	where it may consider updating and		
	sector	announcing the yet unapproved		
		Balochistan Horticulture Policy drafted in		
		May 2008		
		It may also consider finalizing draft	Agriculture and	
		Agriculture Policy framed in	Cooperatives dept.;	
		collaboration with Food and Agriculture	Pⅅ can support	
		Organization (FAO). For regulatory	formulation of rural	
		constraints faced by this sector a rural	SMEs strategy	
		SMEs strategy may be formulated.		
9.	Reduce information asymmetry	Create mobile-based information sharing	NITB in collaboration	GRASP AMIS initiative
		ecosystem to allow farmers access to	with Agriculture and	is also under process.
		best information about prices in various	Cooperatives	
		markets	department. Potential	
			partners could include	

No.	Need for change	Proposed action	Responsibility	Ongoing initiatives
			private telecom firms	
			and other software	
			developers.	
10.	Better pricing for farmers	Revisit the role of intermediaries e.g.	Agriculture and	
		middlemen (arthis) through proper	Cooperatives dept.	
		legislation, including registration,		
		training and licensing / certification		
		(minimum set of standards for		
		middlemen to operate in the market)		
11.	Improve logistics to prevent post-	Balochistan government may draft a	Transport department;	
	harvest losses	policy to incentivize investments in value	P&D department	
		chain infrastructure. More specifically		
		this could include looking in to cold chain		
		and broader transport, warehousing, and		
		storage facilities.		
12.	Improve quality of products to increase	Introduce registration and certification	Agriculture and	
	competitiveness	of privately-operated pack houses /	Cooperatives dept;	
		collection centers / added value centers	P&D department	
		and privately operated wholesale		
		markets with government in a		
		supervisory role	"	
		Introduce minimum, value-chain-wide		
		accepted quality and grading standard		
		for fruits and vegetables	"	
		Develop and implement customized Good Agriculture Practice in line with		
		global standards. For exporters facility of		
		affordable testing and certification may		
		be made available		
13.	Enable exportability and improve	Establish FMD-controlled zone and	Livestock & Dairy	Summary under
	productivity	licensing regime for livestock tagging	Development dept.	process and request of
		under PPP mode whilst fast-tracking the		LDDD sent to Board of
				Revenue for

No.	Need for change	Proposed action	Responsibility	Ongoing initiatives
		plans to set up Milk and Meat City in Lasbela and Quetta as pilot projects		identification of land for the proposed Milk and Meat Cities.
14.	Improve nutrition and clean-in-place practices at livestock farms	Strengthen livestock extension services with emphasis on women as extension staff Certification and legislation of Village Animal Health Workers for introduction of minimum set of standards Increase prevalence of contracts between upstream and downstream value chain actors to help sharing of information and training of livestock farmers by dairy/meat businesses	Livestock & Dairy Development dept.	
15.	Improve quality of meat to increase competitiveness	Legislation of privately operated certified slaughterhouses with government in a supervisory role	Livestock & Dairy Development dept.	GRASP supporting the department to develop manual (including SoPs) for slaughterhouses as per international best practices.
16.	Foster competition in dairy market	Deregulate milk prices currently regulated by Local Government department	Balochistan Cabinet and Local Government & Rural Development	
17.	Promote formalization of dairy market	Promote packaged & branded milk by raising awareness and facilitating small scale pasteurization units	Livestock & Dairy Development dept.; Balochistan Board of Investment & Trade	
18.	Streamline coordination mechanisms to implement livestock and agriculture policy measures	Design mechanism to improve coordination between the concerned departments both at policy and implementation level	Balochistan Cabinet and relevant line departments	

#### Conclusion

Vibrant rural SMEs are critical to absorb Balochistan's workforce, develop rural economy, and reduce poverty by increasing the supply of primary products with consistency of quality to meet rising domestic demand and to tap the export potential. The province requires an effective support from federal government and central bank to improve overall business climate and regulatory regime for domestic commerce. An early formulation of federal SME policy could help clear the funding, finance, and inclusion related challenges as well. All this will be in line with the ambitions laid down in the National Financial Inclusion Strategy; priority SDGs framework of the Planning Commission; the upcoming Strategic Trade Policy Framework that envisages growth in export of fruits, vegetables and processed food and beverages<sup>13</sup>. Such an approach also compliments the Prime Minister's vision for rural SMEs and chicken and eggs production initiative<sup>14</sup>, distributing livestock animals across rural women population<sup>15</sup>; and the recently launched Honey Tsunami Program<sup>16</sup>.

This intent and planned developments under Southern Balochistan package by the federal government are set to kickstart a new era in private sector development across the province. It will therefore be timely for the provincial government to provide policy certainty for the medium and longer term through early formulation and approval of a rural SMEs strategy.

As a policy document, BLPS 2020-2030 offers comprehensive approach to key reform objectives. However, an effective rural SMEs strategy aimed at specific five-year action plan is also needed to be spelled out by provincial government alongside specific action plans and roles and responsibilities of relevant departments. To this end, the above recommendations will yield effective implementation of both BLPS 2020-2030, and help toward the much-needed formulation of horticulture policy and a coherent regulatory framework drafted through dialogue and consultation.

While most of our recommendations are specific to horticulture and livestock sectors, it is important to note that there are also some structural recommendations which will require attention of provincial leadership. Most notably, these include the need to improve essential capabilities for demand and use of evidence for policy decisions in line departments; to plug data gaps which impinge timely decision making; and the need to create mechanisms for, and hold, structured public private dialogue, which is necessary to help businesses see longer term gains in these sectors.

\*\*\*\*\*\*

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>13</sup> https://nation.com.pk/24-May-2020/strategic-trade-policy-framework-to-increase-exports-to-dollar-46b-in-5-years

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>14</sup> https://tribune.com.pk/story/1860121/1-following-pms-chicken-egg-vision-govt-kicks-off-poultry-campaign

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>15</sup> https://www.thenews.com.pk/print/617618-more-good-news-for-people-buffaloes-cows-and-goats-for-women-says-pm

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>16</sup> https://www.dawn.com/news/1597047

ABOUT THE PROJECT: "GROWTH FOR RURAL ADVANCEMENT AND SUSTAINABLE PROGRESS (GRASP)"

ITC is the lead implementing agency for the "Growth for Rural Advancement and Sustainable Progress" project, funded by the European Union (EU). The project objective is to support gender inclusive income and employment generation, enhanced productivity and profitability of SMEs involved in primary production, service provision, and value addition in and around selected clusters of production. GRASP will intervene in two of the agriculture sectors i.e. Livestock and Horticulture sectors in Sindh and Balochistan. For complementary survey results please visit: www.intracen.org/GRASP/

For preparation of this policy brief and proposed recommendations, ITC has collaborated with Sustainable Development Policy Institute (<u>www.sdpi.org</u>).